Public Consultation Preliminary Analysis (13/08/13)



Overview

Some responses were duplicates or only completed the "General Information" page

Some respondents did not finish the survey





End-to-end vaccine supply chain process and stakeholder maps



1 Supply chain designs differs by countries – Some countries have additional layer (zonal) after regional depots, making it a 5-level SC; Others have fewer levels under a "hub" concept; down to district level, transportation can be delivered by upper level, or collected by lower level

2 Regional, zonal or state level depots or hubs 3 Health office and/or storage

4 Data includes logistics/supply information (eg. how much was received, used, remains on hand) and service information

SOURCE: Team analysis

Most respondents said the process map captured all the essential steps in the supply chain



GLOBAL: What would you add?

- Information flows from country to manufacturer
- Self-procurement scenarios
- More detail info forecasting in the global supply chain
- Importance of cross border cooperation (between districts and countries)
- Role of the private sector
- Integrated supply chains

Does the process map capture the essential steps in the IN-COUNTRY supply chain?



IN-COUNTRY: What would you add?

- · Assessment of cold chain requirements
- Opportunities to return vaccines which have been damaged
- In-country plans and assessments e.g. EVM, EVMIP, cold chain rehabilitation
- Role of NGOs, national drug authorities, and partner agencies (in partnership with, or in place of, MoH
- Differentiate between fixed and mobile campaigns

Consolidated view of the most cited challenges along the supply chain

Global		Interface		In-country	
Applications and Approval	3 Short-term planning & procurement	Delivery to countries	Storage & distribution	6 Availability at point of vaccination	
2.1 Long lead times for approval due to lengthy application and approval	3.1 Poor quality of short- term country forecasts3.2 Frequent short term	4.1 Long lead-times and delays in getting shipment clearance	5.1 Multiple levels of supply chain holding inventories cause inefficiencies	6.1 Limited transparency on the frequency, size and location of demand	
processes	updates of the demand forecast communicated to manufacturers	4.2 Lack of transparency into shipment data	5.2 Insufficient or non- functional cold chain equipment		
	 3.3.Last minute sharing of procurement plan and changes with manufacturers 3.4 Missed return on investment from money on "Procurement Accounts" 3.5 Delay of fund transfer from countries for co-funding of vaccines 3.6 Countries do not always receive products according to their preferred specification 3.7 Vx intro decisions and scheduling are not robust enough and change frequently 		5.3 Suboptimal cold chain equipment selection		
			5.4 Poor equipment repair and maintenance		
			5.5 Lack of well-documented SC processes and often not well implemented		
			 5.6 Limited expertise to operate and oversee SC, and to implement SC processes 5.7 Ad-hoc delivery schedule leading to unreliable distribution 5.8 Insufficient vehicles and other transportation resources 		
	Applications and Approval 2.1 Long lead times for approval due to lengthy application and approval processes	balInterApplications and Approval32.1 Long lead times for approval due to lengthy application and approval processes3.1 Poor quality of short- term country forecasts 3.2 Frequent short term updates of the demand forecast communicated to manufacturers3.3.Last minute sharing of procurement plan and changes with manufacturers3.4 Missed return on investment from money on "Procurement Accounts"3.5 Delay of fund transfer from countries for co-funding of vaccines3.6 Countries do not always receive products according to their preferred specification3.7 Vx intro decisions and scheduling are not robust enough and change frequently	bal Interface Applications and Approval Short-term planning & procurement Delivery to countries 2.1 Long lead times for approval due to lengthy application and approval processes 3.1 Poor quality of short- term country forecasts 1.1 Long lead-times and delays in getting shipment 3.2 Frequent short term updates of the demand forecast communicated to manufacturers 3.1.2 St minute sharing of procurement plan and changes with manufacturers 4.1 Long lead-times and delays in getting shipment 3.3.Last minute sharing of procurement plan and changes with manufacturers 3.4 Missed return on investment from money on "Procurement Accounts" 4.2 Lack of transparency into shipment data 3.5 Delay of fund transfer from countries for co-funding of vaccines 3.6 Countries do not always receive products according to their preferred specification 3.7 Vx intro decisions and scheduling are not robust enough and change frequently	balInterfaceIn-coApplications and ApprovalShort-term planning & procurementImage: Short-term planning & short-term country forecastsImage: Short-term planning & short-term country forecastsImage: Short-term planning & short-term country forecastsImage: Short-term planning & short-term plan and changes with manufacturersImage: Short-term planning & short-term plan and change procurement Accounts'Image: Short-term planning & short-term plan and & short-term plan and change procurement Accounts'Image: Short-term planning & short-term planni	

7.1 Lack of functioning information systems providing timely and accurate data

7.2 Data not routinely used, analyzed, or incorporated into decision-making

8 Performance Management

8.1 Limited implementation of improvements following EVM

8.2 Lack of end-to-end performance management and standardized performance management metrics

SOURCE: Expert interviews; team analysis

Do the challenges presented in Figure 2 appear in your own supply chain or supply chains you've observed?



What challenges have we missed:

- No tracking system up to user level
- Failure to adequately create demand and mobilize communities
- Budgetary constraints
- Storage capacity of warehouses
- No engagement between suppliers and countries
- No geographical surveillance system to help prioritize SC needs
- Top-down planning
- Vertical nature of vaccines
- Waste management
- Impact of SIAs on RI
- No bundling of vaccines and equipment
- Support to complete GAVI application and reporting forms



Methodology used to analyse ranking of challenges





Global challenges: Prioritised





Global challenges: Prioritised by perspective (country/global)





Interface challenges: Prioritised



Interface challenges: Prioritised by perspective (country/global)



In-country challenges: Prioritised





In-country challenges: Prioritised by perspective (country/global)





84% of respondents said they believed the following objectives were appropriate and comprehensive enough

1	Affordability, or "Right cost"	Minimize total supply chain wasted / inefficient cost per dose	
2	Accessibility, or "Right vaccines; Right place; Right time; Right quantities"	Ensure product availability at point of vaccination	
3	Suitability, or "Right condition"	Store and transport at correct temp (including monitoring)	
	Do you think these objectives are appropriate and comprehensive enough?	No 16% Yes 84%	
	Public Consultation Preliminary Analysis		

Do you think these objectives are appropriate and comprehensive enough? Discuss:

Indeed, these objectives are appropriate and paramount to success. However, they are not comprehensive. I believe HR capacity building, sensitization to issues, training and retention of talent are the key issues to address, and the rest will be far more achievable.

- I think Visibility is just as important, both for operational purposes as well as for performance management/M&E. Although subsumed under "accessibility", data for decision making is too important and impacts every other objective, and therefore deserves it's own objective.
- An objective for demand creation for ensuring utilization/uptake of vaccines will be required otherwise wastage will be high
- Sustainability including developing in-country SC&L capacity and salaries
- Right presentation of the vaccine is an important factor for determining storage/transport capacity, open vial wastage and ease of administration.
- Add right information in right time

"



How feasible do you think it is to collect the data to estimate these indicators on a routine monitoring basis?

Slides 16& 17 to be updated with input from John Lloyd

Proposed Objective	Proposed Indicators		
Affordability	 Vaccine utilization rate (doses administered/doses distributed) Vaccine stock movement rate Supply chain cost per dose administered 		
Accessibility	 Vaccine availability index (measuring lack of stock-outs.) Supply regularity and timeliness 		
Suitability	6. Storage temperature alarm reporting		



Are there any indicators which you think should be deleted and/or added? Please comment:

An indicator could capture as well the logistical constraint to rend it accessible to the point of service, like the number of km from the central depot. Then it could explain some of the variation of the indicator 3 which would need to be calculated at different levels in order to know if more investment is needed in some places if indicator 4 is low. Do you intend to group all the indicators in an index ?

- What about forecasting accuracy rate? and also an indicator on budget management?
- Supply Chain cost per dose: I very much like this indicator, however, I don't see how it could be reliably calculated. In reality (from my experience) vehicles at the district level (or even regional level) are rarely used exclusively for vaccines. How would this be taken into consideration in the formula? Or would you consider it relevant to take this fact into account? It seems likely that the use of the formula will result in an overestimation of the cost per dose. The aim is to integrate immunization in the basic health system. It is not a stand-alone vertical programme that could be measured without taking into account interlinked health (supply chain) activities (e.g. transporting drugs and medical equipment or movement of health workers). In general, I would suggest to limit the list to 5 indicators at most to increase feasibility of collection. Most of the data is to be collected at district level which generally is the weakest link in the overall system... It will be important to communicate and demonstrate the benefit of additional data collection and use of indicators in a way that all actors involved can identify with.



Closing comments on the supply chain strategy

Learn about supply chain practices from industries were SCM is a strategic pillar: consumer packaged goods industry (food and beverage), 3rd party logistics, etc.

- Could we imagine vaccines outside of the cold chain?
- Objectives should consider two parallel tracks: (1) what GAVI can influence directly (significant at Global level) and (2) what GAVI can influence only indirectly, either because of lack of funds or scope that is outside their mandate. The latter can be important in terms of Global dialogue and advocacy for future investments.
- To improve SCM, it will also be vital to think about the introduction of new cold chain equipment (as pointed out in previous slides). In this respect, I believe that it is key not only to consider the most innovative technology but to ensure that there is great acceptance for the technology that is being proposed and that maintenance is feasible in low-income settings. The more complex the technology and its maintenance, the less likely it is that their use will be sustainable. Also, when making recommendations as to whether solar or gas-based fridges should be used, one should closely consult with the partner countries to hear what they prefer. In times where countries like Tanzania discover gas resources, there might be less willingness to pay high procurement costs for solar equipment that seems to deteriorate more quickly under their weather conditions than in northern countries.



What does this mean for the strategy?

- Global challenges
 - Data remains a priority
 - Increased attention to the lead times for approval (to be responded to through the grant management redesign process)

Interface challenges

 Explore opportunities to improve short-term forecasting (through data, LMIS, training...???) and processes releasing funds for co-financing

Country challenges

 CCE, people & process and transport validated as priorities



www.gavialliance.org

