

# Memorandum on the Programme Audit Report For the Republic of Chad

The attached audit report sets out the conclusions of the programme audit of Gavi's support to the Immunization Programme of the Government of Chad, implemented by the Ministry of Public Health and Prevention (MSPP). The audit work, conducted by Gavi's programme audit team in August 2024, focused on the use of Gavi grants disbursed between January 1, 2021, and December 31, 2023, as well as the reconstructed accounts for the years 2017 and 2018. These grants supported health system strengthening, operational costs for routine immunization and campaigns, as well as support from the COVAX Facility in 2021 and 2022.

This audit follows the 2021 audit, which covered the period from 2017 to 2020 and found unsatisfactory management of the Gavi-supported programme, with an inability to conclude on financial and accounting management due to the absence of accounting records for 2017 and 2018. The current audit has therefore made it possible to finalize the work on the accounts for 2017 and 2018, and to examine the management of the program during the period from 2021 to 2023.

The key points of the audit summary (pages 3 to 5), further detailed in the body of the document, are as follows:

1. Overall, the management of Gavi support was assessed as **requiring significant improvement** (page 3), meaning that "Internal controls, governance and risk management practices have some weaknesses in design or operating effectiveness such that, there is not yet reasonable assurance that the entity's objectives are likely to be met."
2. Twenty-three (23) recommendations were made in response to deficiencies identified in: (i) Governance; ii) Financial and accounting management; (iii) Procurement; (iv) Vaccine management; and (v) Monitoring and evaluation.
3. Key findings included the following:
  - a. Programme governance still faces major challenges, with insufficient implementation of the 2021 audit recommendations and irregular functioning of key bodies such as the Inter-Agency Coordination Committee (ICC) and the steering committee of the UGP. Despite strengthened human resources and recent initiatives by the new EPI team, dysfunctions persist, affecting coordination, disbursements, and activity execution.
  - b. The reconstruction of accounts for the 2017–2018 period did not fully meet expectations, as supporting documents for expenditures amounting to USD 342,794 could not be retrieved. Furthermore, although the Project Management Unit (PMU) strengthened its internal control system between 2021 and 2023, weaknesses remain in archiving, budget monitoring, procurement, and the management of bank accounts and fixed assets, leading to the questioning of USD 103,453 in expenditures.

- c. The audit revealed insufficient procurement planning by the UGP between 2021 and 2023, resulting in delays and non-compliance with competitive bidding procedures.
- d. Despite some progress, persistent weaknesses affect vaccine management, cold chain operations, stock monitoring, and data quality, due to limited regulatory oversight, inadequate monitoring, and incomplete adoption of digital data reporting tools.

The audit findings were shared with the MSPP, which responded by developing a corrective action plan to address the identified deficiencies. A reimbursement request for USD 446,247, corresponding to the total questioned expenditures, was also submitted to the ministry by Gavi's country team.

Gavi's Secretariat continues to work with the MSPP to ensure that the commitments made are implemented and to establish a reimbursement schedule for the aforementioned questioned expenditures.

Geneva, August 2025

# PROGRAMME AUDIT REPORT

THE REPUBLIC OF CHAD

JULY 2025

## Contents

<b>1. Executive Summary</b>	<b>3</b>
1.1. Audit findings by category	3
1.2. Overall audit opinion	3
1.3. Detailed summary	4
1.4. Financial impact of audit findings	5

## 1. Executive Summary

### 1.1. Audit findings by category

Section*	Finding	Risk*	Page
<b>4.1</b>	<b>Governance and organisational performance</b>		<b>10</b>
4.1.1	Inadequate implementation of previous audit recommendations	■	10
4.1.2	Weak operation of the program's strategic and technical steering committees	■	11
4.1.3	Irregular running of the PMU's governance bodies	■	13
4.1.4	Challenges in streamlining communication between the Directorate of Vaccination and the PMU	■	15
4.1.5	Identified Shortcomings in Human Resource Management within the PMU	■	17
4.1.6	Need for capacity building of peripheral-level staff	■	18
<b>4.2</b>	<b>Accounting and financial management</b>		<b>19</b>
4.2.1	Inadequate bookkeeping: findings from the review of the SDV's 2017–2018 reconstructed accounts	■	19
4.2.2	Weakness in budgetary analysis	■	20
4.2.3	Weaknesses in Bank account management	■	21
4.2.4	Deficiencies in the mobile payment mechanism	■	23
4.2.5	Inadequate monitoring of the clearance of advances over the audit period	■	24
4.2.6	Weaknesses identified in accounting archiving practices	■	25
4.2.7	Expenditures questioned by the audit	■	26
4.2.8	Weaknesses in asset management	■	27
<b>4.3</b>	<b>Procurement</b>		<b>29</b>
4.3.1	Shortcomings in procurement planning	■	29
4.3.2	Weaknesses in contract management	■	30
<b>4.4</b>	<b>Vaccine management</b>		<b>31</b>
4.4.1	Inadequate tailoring and deployment of SOPs	■	31
4.4.2	Identified deficiencies in cold chain management practices	■	32
4.4.3	Non-compliant storage practices in warehouses	■	34
4.4.4	Inadequate physical management of vaccines	■	35
4.4.5	Deficiencies in administrative management of vaccine inventories	■	36
<b>4.5</b>	<b>Monitoring and evaluation</b>		<b>38</b>
4.5.1	Poor quality of vaccination data	■	38
4.5.2	Insufficient quality of supervisory activities	■	41

### 1.2. Overall audit opinion

For the period under review, the audit team determined that the management of Gavi's support by the Ministry of Public Health and Prevention **needs significant improvement**, which means that the internal controls, governance, and risk management processes have some weaknesses in design or operating effectiveness such that, there is not yet reasonable assurance that the entity's objectives are likely to be met.

In order to reduce the risks associated with the above findings, the team raised **23 recommendations** requiring the implementation of the remedial action plan (detailed in **Annex 8 of this report**).

\* The audit ratings attributed to each category, the level of risk assigned to each audit finding and the level of priority for each recommendation, are defined in Annex 2 of this report.

### 1.3. Detailed summary

This report sets out the conclusion of the Gavi programme audit carried out in Chad in 2024, on covering various aspects of Gavi's support to the country. It follows the 2021 program audit that covered the period from 2017 to 2020 and concluded that the support provided by Gavi had been poorly managed by the Ministry of Public Health and National Solidarity (MSPSN), known as the Ministry of Public Health and Prevention (MSPP) since 2023. A general improvement in program governance was observed during the current audit, resulting in a more favorable audit opinion (see Section 1.2 above).

From 2017 to 2018, Gavi grants were administered by UNICEF. Since 2019, the MSPP established a Project Management Unit (PMU), which took over this responsibility. The previous audit, which spanned both periods, was unable to conclude on the use of Gavi funds disbursed by UNICEF to the Sub-Directorate of Vaccination (SDV)—now the Directorate of Vaccination—between 2017 and 2018, as the latter had not presented any accounting records of expenditures made on behalf of the MSPP during those two years. The audit therefore recommended that the MSPP gather supporting documentation and reconstruct the accounts for review in the subsequent audit.

The current audit thus examined the reconstructed accounts for 2017 and 2018, monitored the progress of corrective actions undertaken by the MSPP following the previous audit, and assessed the management of Gavi support during the 2021–2023 period. The audit work revealed certain structural improvements within the Directorate of Vaccination and a strengthening of the grant management framework by the UGP. However, some deficiencies identified in the previous audit remain unresolved.

#### **Governance and organisational performance**

The corrective action plan proposed by the MSPP in response to the recommendations of the previous audit was not sufficiently implemented. As a result, the weaknesses in strategic oversight and the functioning of operational management structures identified in 2021 remain unresolved. This is particularly the case for the Interagency Coordination Committee (ICC), a key body for strategic program oversight, which lacked regular meetings and did not fully carry out its assigned roles. This dysfunction of the ICC is one of the main causes of the persistent weaknesses observed in the current audit.

Similar to the ICC, the PMU Steering Committee and its Audit Committee, established in 2021 by the MSPP to ensure sound management of external grants, have experienced a progressive decline in functionality. As a result, the PMU has not received the necessary support to address certain management challenges described in Section 4 of this report, particularly regarding its interaction with other program implementation entities within the MSPP. Specifically, the need to clarify roles, responsibilities, and operation processes between the PMU and the Directorate of Vaccination, as recommended in the 2021 audit, was not addressed by the governance bodies. This has led to coordination and collaboration difficulties between these two key program actors, affecting, among other things, fund disbursement timelines and the implementation of several essential activities.

Between 2021 and 2022, the MSPP, with support from partners, undertook a quantitative and qualitative renewal of staff within the Directorate of Vaccination, resulting in a revitalization of

the program's technical services at the central level. However, initiatives launched by the new team in areas such as staff training, vaccine and cold chain management, and improvement of immunization coverage data quality have not yet yielded significant impact. Consequently, deficiencies identified in 2021 in program management remain a challenge at various levels of the health system pyramid.

#### **Accounting and financial management**

This audit enabled a review of the use of financial resources allocated to the country during the 2017–2018 period, as well as an assessment of the management of Gavi grants by the PMU on behalf of the MSPP during the 2021–2023 period.

For the 2017–2018 period, the account reconstruction initiative did not yield full satisfaction. Although supporting documents up to 82% of expenditures were retrieved, they were not properly organized to facilitate the audit, and reliable financial statements could not be produced. The unreconciled gap, due to missing documentation and subject to audit questioning, amounts to USD 342,794, representing 18% of the total amount to be reconstructed.

The establishment of the PMU led to improvements in the internal control framework applied to the management of financial resources disbursed by Gavi to the Government of Chad, as well as in internal and external oversight mechanisms. However, the PMU has not yet satisfactorily addressed certain critical issues raised in the 2021 audit, including weaknesses in the archiving of supporting documents, monitoring of fund advances to decentralized MSPP entities, budget analysis, and compliance with procurement procedures as described below. Due to inadequate supporting documentation, the audit questioned an amount of USD 103,453, representing 1% of the expenditures tested for the 2021–2023 period.

The audit also identified gaps in the monitoring of bank accounts by the PMU, in the operationalization of the mobile payment mechanism through telecom operators, and in the tracking of fixed assets acquired with Gavi funding.

#### **Procurement**

Except for cold chain equipment, incinerators, and transport logistics equipment procured through UNICEF, in accordance with the agreement between Gavi and the Government of the Republic of Chad, all other purchases were executed by the PMU. The audit revealed insufficient procurement planning by the PMU. Contrary to the provisions of the PMU's procedures manual, Procurement Plans were not developed for the years 2021, 2022, and 2023, which hindered a comprehensive overview of planned procurements for each year and the implementation of appropriate competitive bidding procedures.

As a result, many procurement processes were delayed or executed without adequate competition. A similar weakness was reported by the Gavi audit team in 2021.

**Vaccine Management**

The Effective Vaccine Management (EVM) assessment conducted in May 2024 resulted in a score of 76%. It highlights that, despite overall improvements compared to the 2015 EVM assessment, significant weaknesses persist in vaccine management practices across all levels of the health system. Audit procedures carried out at the central level, as well as field visits to selected districts and health centers, revealed that these deficiencies are largely attributable to the inadequate understanding and application of the normative framework governing vaccine management by relevant stakeholders.

The Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) developed by the Directorate of Vaccination to address this gap were neither published in a user-friendly format nor effectively disseminated. Consequently, weaknesses were observed in both cold chain and warehouse management, as well as in the physical and administrative handling of vaccines.

At the central level, the cold chain facilities are operating at full capacity and do not comply with safety standards related to fire and flood risks. Similar deficiencies were noted in the storage facilities for other vaccine supplies. Furthermore, temperature is not monitored during the transportation of vaccines. Additionally, the control and tracking of vaccine stock movements via the Stock Management Tools (SMT) system exhibit notable shortcomings. A project to construct a new central warehouse, jointly financed by Gavi and the Global Fund, was initiated in 2023. However, its implementation has experienced delays due to unresolved land tenure issues.

At the intermediate and peripheral levels, the absence of an effective maintenance plan for cold chain equipment has hindered the timely repair and servicing of critical assets. Field visits to the districts of N'Djamena-Centre, Abéché, and Adré revealed several instances of equipment being non-operational or affected by unresolved technical issues. Moreover, the limited quality of supervision provided to operational-level personnel has failed to address key gaps in the physical and administrative management of vaccines. Numerous deficiencies were identified during site visits, including non-compliance with vaccine storage protocols and the lack of tracking mechanisms for vaccine usage based on batch numbers and expiration dates.

**Monitoring and evaluation**

The monitoring and evaluation mechanism has not undergone any significant improvement compared to the previous audit. The quality of immunization coverage data remains a concern, primarily due to challenges faced by peripheral-level stakeholders in adopting the DHIS2 digital platform, which was introduced in Chad in 2022 to replace the Excel tool (DVDMT). Until the end of 2023, data collection personnel continued to favor the use of DVDMT, despite its inherent risks of data distortion. Triangulation analyses conducted during the audit revealed numerous inconsistencies in the reported data.

Following a directive issued by the Secretary General of the Ministry of Public Health and Prevention (MSPP), DHIS2 has been used exclusively since January 2024. However, data entry controls at the collection points remain insufficient.

Furthermore, supervisory activities at the peripheral levels (districts and health centers) have lacked effectiveness. Issues related to effective vaccine management and data quality have not

been adequately examined or addressed during these supervisory visits, resulting in the persistence of numerous deficiencies identified in the current audit.

Nevertheless, in 2023, the newly appointed team at the Directorate of Vaccination conducted a national coverage survey and developed a plan aimed at improving data quality for the period 2024–2028.

**1.4. Financial impact of audit findings**

The quantitative impact of the findings is summarised in the table below, making up the total amount questioned by the audit team and therefore likely to be the subject of a request for reimbursement.

*Table 1 – Summary of total amounts questioned by the audit team*

Grant	Tested Expenditures	1. Inadequately justified expenditures	2. Unjustified expenditures	3. Irregular expenditures	4. Ineligible expenditures	Total questioned expenditures (1+2+3+4)	% of total tested
		Section 4.2.7 / Annexes 4&5	Section 4.2.7 / Annexes 4&5	Section 4.2.7 / Annexes 4&5	Section 4.2.8 / Annexes 4&5		
Reconstructed accounts 2017-2018	1,092,406,027		192,649,989			192,649,989	18%
	1,943,783		342,794			342,794	
PMU accounts 2021-2023	7,104,773,766	43,745,630		14,591,500	3,217,279	61,554,409	1%
	11,940,796	73,522		24,524	5,407	103,453	
<b>Total</b>	<b>8,197,179,793</b>	43,745,630	192,649,989	14,591,500	3,217,279	<b>254,204,398</b>	<b>3%</b>
	<b>13,884,579</b>	73,522	342,794	24,524	5,407	<b>446,247</b>	

FCFA - USD