## Memorandum on the Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal Programme Audit report (2) (in complement to an earlier report)

The attached Audit and Investigations report – in complement to the previous programme audit report, published in April 2024 – sets out additional conclusions on the programme audit of Gavi's support to the Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal's Ministry of Health and Population (MoHP), executed by the Family Welfare Division, implementing departments belonging to the Department of Health Services along with other implementing partners.

It summarises the additional work conducted in supplement to the prior programme audit that was initiated in 2022 and finalised in April 2024. Under the present scope, the audit team focused on completing its review of the MoHP's budgeting, financial management, and assurance areas, including the documentation evidencing the use of Gavi cash support disbursed to or managed by the MoHP during the five-year period January 2017 to December 2021.

The team also reviewed the assurance management framework in place, as well as revisiting the current status of Management's agreed actions, including the extent to which they were implemented.

The report's executive summary (pages 2 to 4) summarises the key conclusions, the details of which are set out in the body of the report:

- Consistent with the prior report, the overall audit rating remains as "needs significant improvement", which means, "One or few significant issues were noted. Internal controls, governance and risk management practices have some weaknesses in design or operating effectiveness such that, until they are addressed, there is not yet reasonable assurance that the objectives are likely to be met."
- 2. In total, five issues were identified in the following areas: (i) budgeting and financial management; (ii) assurance provider framework; and (ii) implementation status of prior audit recommendations.
- 3. To address the risks associated with the issues, the audit team raised five recommendations of which one was rated as high priority.
- 4. Key findings were that:
  - a. The budgetary and financial management of the country is challenged by ineffective oversight mechanism at national level, an inadequate controls environment over financial management at national and provincial levels, turnover of staff at subnational

- levels due to decentralisation and insufficient document retention processes leading to Government's inability to maintain adequate accountability over Gavi's funds.
- b. Strengthening of the assurance provider mechanism to be undertaken to support the MoHP in strengthening its budgeting and financial management procedures
- c. The audit noted some progress in implementing agreed management actions in prior audit recommendation and the Ministry of Health and Population committed to implementing the outstanding recommendations within the agreed timeline.

The findings of the follow up programme audit were discussed with the Ministry of Health and Population and implementing partners. They accepted the audit findings, acknowledged the weaknesses identified.

In November 2024, Gavi wrote to the government requesting reimbursement for USD 310,899, an amount which was determined to be misused, as well as asking the MoHP to develop and commit to implementing a management action plan addressing the additional findings. The Gavi Secretariat continues to work with the Ministry of Health and Population, the Family Welfare Division, and the Department of Health Services to ensure that these commitments are implemented, and to agree on how to make the programme whole, pending receiving their commitment.

Geneva, November 2024

# PROGRAMME AUDIT REPORT

In complement to the April 2024 programme audit report

**Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal November 2024** 



## **Table of Contents**

| 1.   | Executive Summary    | 2 |  |  |
|------|----------------------|---|--|--|
| 2.   | Objectives and Scope | 5 |  |  |
| 3.   | Background           | 8 |  |  |
| 4.   | Audit Issues         | 9 |  |  |
| Anne | Annexes              |   |  |  |

### 1. Executive Summary

### 1.1 Overall audit opinion

The audit team assessed the Ministry of Health and Population's management of Gavi support, during the five-year period 1 January 2017 to 31 December 2021, as "Needs significant improvement" which means, "one or few significant issues were noted. Internal controls, governance and risk management practices have some weaknesses in design or operating effectiveness such that, until they are addressed, there is not yet reasonable assurance that the objectives are likely to be met."

Through our audit procedures, we have identified high risk issues relating to budget and financial management. To address the risks associated with the issues, the audit team raised five recommendations, of which one (20%) was rated as high risk. The recommendations need to be addressed by implementing remedial measures according to the agreed management actions.

Significant progress was made in addressing 2022 programme audit recommendations and the Ministry of Health and Population committed to implementing the outstanding recommendations within the agreed timeline.

### 1.2 Summary of key audit issues

| Ref   | Description  | Rating* | Page |
|-------|--|---------|------|
| 4.1   | Budget and Financial Management  |         | 9    |
| 4.1.1 | Inadequate systematic budget and work plan monitoring and reporting system |         | 9    |
| 4.1.2 | Gaps in financial management controls resulted in questioned expenditure   |         | 11   |
| 4.2   | Assurance Provider Framework   |         | 14   |
| 4.2.1 | Strengthening of Assurance Provider mechanism                              |         | 14   |
| 4.3   | Implementation Status of Prior Recommendations                             |         | 16   |
| 4.3.1 | Some progress was made in addressing 2022 Programme Audit recommendations  |         | 16   |
| 4.3.2 | Grant management requirements are still outstanding                        |         | 18   |

<sup>\*</sup> The audit ratings attributed to each section of this report, the level of risk assigned to each audit issue, and the level of priority for each recommendation, are defined in **Annex 3** of this report.

#### 1.3 Summary of issues

This report supplements the previous audit carried out in 2022 – since published in April 2024 – in which the audit team was unable to express an opinion on Gavi-funded expenditures incurred by the Ministry of Health and Population (MoHP). Following the team completing its review of Gavi-funded expenditures incurred by the MoHP during the period from 1 January 2017 to 31 December 2021, herein are the team's additional conclusions.

The results of this review do not change the overall "needs significant improvement" opinion provided in the 2022 audit report. In this review, the audit team identified one high risk and four medium risk issues regarding the: financial management processes in managing Gavi support; assurance provider framework; and the implementation of previous recommendations. Details on these issues are provided in Section 4 of this report.

### **Budgeting and Financial Management**

Between 2017 and 2021, Gavi directly disbursed USD 27 million in cash to the MoHP in relation to the following grants: Health systems strengthening (HSS); Measles rubella follow-up campaign; TCV campaign; Product switch, and various vaccine introduction grants.

The audit team reviewed a sample of USD 1.6 million expenditures incurred at the: DoHS central, provincial and district levels, during the audit period. The team concluded that expenditures totalling USD 0.31 million were unsupported or inadequately supported (table 1 below).

The audit team attributed the gaps in budgetary and finance management to: ineffective oversight mechanism at national level, an inadequate control environment over financial management at national and provincial levels, turnover of staff at subnational levels due to decentralisation and insufficient document retention processes.

The team concluded that while the Department of Health Services' (DoHS) weaknesses in budget and finance management remain unaddressed, the Government will be unable to maintain adequate accountability over Gavi's funds, impacting the effectiveness of the immunisation programme, and potentially resulting in funds being misused as well as consequences for Gavi's future funding.

### 1.4 Financial consequences of audit findings

The audit team reviewed a sample of expenditures totalling USD 1.6 million drawn from the five-year audit period (2017-2021), representing 22% of the total expenditures that were directly incurred by the MoHP during this period. The review of expenditures resulted in questioning amounts totalling USD 0.31 million, equivalent to 19% of the audit sample.

Most of the transactions questioned were deemed to be unsupported or inadequately supported. A significant amount were also ineligible as shown in the summary table below:

| Table 1: Summary o | f expenditures que | stioned by the au | dit team, by co | itegory in USD: |
|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                    |                    |                   |                 |                 |

| Category of questioned expenditures | Amount<br>questioned<br>(NPR) | Amount<br>questioned<br>(USD) | % of exp.<br>tested | Details<br>(report<br>reference) |  |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------------|--|
| Inadequately supported              | 14,495,048                    | 120,792                       |                     |                                  |  |
| Ineligible                          | 5,009,423                     | 41,745                        |                     |                                  |  |
| Unsupported                         | 17,433,345                    | 145,278                       | 19%                 | 4.1.2                            |  |
| Irregular                           | 54,695                        | 456                           |                     |                                  |  |
| Total questioned                    | 36,992,511                    | 308,271                       |                     |                                  |  |

### 1.5 Unspent cash balances

Table 2: Gavi funds disbursed to Partners, remaining unspent at central level, by grant.

| Gavi grant*   | USD       | Grant end<br>date | Source of information  |
|---|-----------|-------------------|--|
| MoHP – TCV, VIG, HSS                                      | 3,808,987 | Various           | Statement from the Financial Comptroller General Office (FCGO) as on 16 Jul 2022 |
| UNICEF – HSS  | 1,015,218 | 30 June 2024      | Uncertified report for Gavi grants as on 31 Dec 2022                             |
| UNICEF – COVAX Delivery Support (CDS) – Early Access (EA) | 222,964   | 30 June 2023      | Uncertified report for Gavi grants as on 31 Dec 2022                             |
| WHO HSS   | 2,282,557 | 30 June 2024      | Gavi cash grant implementation report as on 3 Jul 2022                           |
| WHO – COVAX<br>Delivery Support (CDS)                     | 1,082,141 | 31 Mar 2023       | Gavi cash grant implementation report as on 3 Jul 2022                           |
| Total   | 8,411,867 |                   |  |

<sup>\*</sup>Gavi's remaining fund balance which is part of the pooled fund account is not included in the table above.

### 2. Objectives and Scope

### 2.1 Audit objective

In line with the respective Partnership Framework Agreement and with Gavi's transparency and accountability policy, all countries that receive support are periodically subject to programme audit, for which the primary objective is to provide reasonable assurance that the resources were used for intended purposes in accordance with Gavi's agreed terms and conditions and were applied to the designated objectives.

The audit team assessed the design and operating effectiveness of the existing financial management processes which support the timely utilisation and accountability of funds, related to Gavi's support for which the respective entities were responsible. The team reviewed the relevance and reliability of the internal control systems relative to the accuracy and integrity of the books and records. The audit team also reviewed the Government's progress in addressing the 2022 programme audit recommendations.

### 2.2 Audit scope

The audit scope covered the five year period from 1 January 2017 to 31 December 2021. The total cash, vaccines and ancillary support provided by Gavi to the Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal in this period is presented in table 3 below.

The Nepalese financial year runs from 16<sup>th</sup> July until 15<sup>th</sup> July. In contrast, Gavi disbursements are aggregated and presented by calendar year (January to December).

| Cash grants                     | 2017       | 2018       | 2019       | 2020      | 2021        | <b>Grand Total</b> |
|---------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-------------|--------------------|
| HSS                             | 3,480,000  | 6,960,000  | 13,946,024 |           | 1,714,855   | 26,100,879         |
| MR follow-up campaign op. costs |            |            | 1,192,467  | 29,850    | 78,776      | 1,301,093          |
| Vaccine introduction grants     |            | 514,078    |            | 482,272   | 451,211     | 1,447,561          |
| Product switch grant            |            | 160,636    |            |           |             | 160,636            |
| CDS - EA                        |            |            |            |           | 2,159,909   | 2,159,909          |
| TCV campaign                    |            |            |            |           | 5,504,524   | 5,504,524          |
| Cash total (a)                  | 3,480,000  | 7,634,714  | 15,138,491 | 512,122   | 9,909,275   | 36,674,602         |
| Equipment support               |            |            |            |           |             |                    |
| CCEOP (b)                       |            | 628,633    | (3,240)    |           | 669,599     | 1,294,992          |
| PEF TCA support                 |            |            |            |           |             |                    |
| PEF TCA (c)                     |            |            | 940,430    | 1,203,101 | 631,737     | 2,775,268          |
| Vaccine support                 |            |            |            |           |             |                    |
| Vaccines total (d)              | 7,170,535  | 6,783,733  | 9,480,458  | 7,965,550 | 118,839,999 | 150,240,275        |
| Total (a + b + c + d)           | 10,650,535 | 15,047,080 | 25,556,139 | 9,680,773 | 130,050,610 | 190,985,137        |

Table 3: Cash, equipment, PEETCA, and vaccines support (2017 to 2021) in USD.

### 2.3 Audit approach

In 2022, a programme audit was conducted by Gavi for which the results, except for financial management, were completed and published in April 2024<sup>1</sup>.

Thereafter, in April 2024, at the request of DoHS and Gavi management, the audit team conducted a supplementary audit of the programmes' financial management component. This additional mission was conducted at the DoHS headquarters, five provincial offices and twelve district offices, with the respective

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal Programme Audit April 2024

management being held responsible for ensuring that all of the necessary documents were available for our review. **Annex 4** provides a list of sites visited by the audit team.

This report supplements the results from the prior audit, at which time the audit team had been unable to express an opinion on of Gavi-funded expenditures incurred by the Ministry of Health and Population (MoHP) because the full documentation was not provided at the time of our audit.

Gavi grant funds amounting to USD 9.5 million were disbursed to UNICEF and WHO. Where these funds were either directly used by both organisations or via the UN agencies' own partners, this resulted in this funding not being part of our audit review (i.e. out of scope) due to the United Nations single audit principle<sup>2</sup>.

Gavi grant funds amounting to USD 17.4 million were disbursed through the Joint Financing Agreement (pooled fund). The pooled fund is subject to a single annual audit by the Auditor General Office, as per the pooled fund agreement. Results of this audit are shared with all pooled fund partners including any refunds expected from MoHP. As a result, these funds were out of scope for this review.

Tables 4 and 5 below, summarise the sources of expenditures that were selected for review by the audit team.

Table 4: Gavi cash disbursements by grant and recipient (2017 to 2021)

| Cash grants                    | Fund Recipient     | Total USD  | Audit comments:              |
|--------------------------------|--------------------|------------|------------------------------|
| HSS                            | UNICEF             | 3,453,974  | Out of scope                 |
|                                | UNICEF SD          | 197,440    | Out of scope                 |
|                                | WHO                | 3,506,024  | Out of scope                 |
|                                | MoHP – Pooled Fund |            |                              |
|                                | Account            | 17,426,026 | Out of scope                 |
|                                | MoHP               | 1,517,415  | Included in scope            |
| Sub-total HSS                  |                    | 26,100,879 |                              |
| MR follow-up campaign op.costs | PWC                | 108,626    | Scoped out by the audit team |
|                                | UNICEF             | 137,778    | Out of scope                 |
|                                | MoHP               | 1,054,689  | Included in scope            |
| Sub-total MR                   |                    | 1,301,093  |                              |
| Rota Virus (RV)                | PWC                | 27,500     | Scoped out by the audit team |
| Product switch grant           | UNICEF             | 31,158     | Out of scope                 |
|                                | МоНР               | 129,478    | Scoped out by the audit team |
| Sub-total switch grant         |                    | 188,136    |                              |
| TCV                            | MoHP               | 5,504,524  | Included in scope            |
| Vaccine introduction grant     | MoHP               | 1,420,061  | Scoped out by the audit team |
| CDS                            | UNICEF             | 1,058,356  | Out of scope                 |
|                                | WHO                | 1,101,553  | Out of scope                 |
| Sub-total TCV, VIG, CDS        |                    | 9,084,494  |                              |
| Grand total                    |                    | 36,674,602 |                              |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The single audit principle is part of a common internal control and audit framework in United Nations system organisations. It directs a system of checks and balances, where the control and audit functions with regard to funds directly expensed by the UN agencies are based on common methods and framework enabling auditors of one institution to rely on the work of auditors from another institution instead of re-performing the audit themselves.

Table 5: Percentage of Gavi-funded expenditures reviewed by the audit team.

| Implementing entity / Province | Expenditures reported (in NPR) | Expenditures reviewed (in NPR) | % reviewed |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------|
| Department of Health Services  |                                | 1,172,900                      | 17%        |
| (DoHS)                         | 6,824,590                      | 1,172,900                      | 1770       |
| Koshi                          | 164,830,307                    | 44,725,067                     | 27%        |
| Madhesh                        | 135,423,988                    | 33,835,871                     | 25%        |
| Bagmati                        | 145,949,384                    | 51,277,705                     | 35%        |
| Lumbini                        | 117,353,609                    | 29,049,163                     | 25%        |
| Sudurpaschim                   | 97,831,532                     | 30,767,939                     | 31%        |
| Karnali                        | 94,481,551                     | ı                              | ı          |
| Gandaki                        | 97,777,060                     | -                              | -          |
| Total                          | 860,472,021                    | 190,828,645                    | 22%        |

The team sampled and reviewed expenditures totalling USD 1.6 million (NPR 190.8 million), which accounted for 22% of the total spending reported by government entities (i.e. the DoHS, provinces and districts) during the period January 2017 to December 2021.

### 2.4 Progress since the 2022 programme audit

Family Welfare Division (FWD) made some progress in implementing the actions agreed by their management in response to the 2022 Gavi programme audit. Nevertheless FWD faced challenges in coordination with other stakeholders outside of FWD. Overall, 37 actions were agreed of which 26 were due to be complete by April 2024. At the time of this audit in April 2024, 12 of the 26 actions have been postponed to a future date by FWD, as they required coordination with other stakeholders outside of the FWD. Though some of the relevant actions have begun, none were completed. The remaining 14 actions were implemented, as evidenced by the supporting documentation, and were considered closed. Refer to **Annex 7** for the status of the management actions.

### 2.5 Exchange rates

Most in-country expenditures were incurred using the Nepalese Rupee (NPR). For information purposes and as part of this report, the overall equivalent amounts are also reflected in United States Dollars (USD). The average exchange rate provided by the Bank of Nepal at the time of conversion from USD account to NPR was used to convert amounts. As a result, the average exchange rate for the five year audit scope period 2017 to 2021 was NPR 120 to USD 1.

### 3. Background

#### 3.1 Introduction

Nepal is a federal democratic republic with 3 levels of government comprising the central federal level, 7 provinces and 753 local governments. There are 77 districts, which were the sub-national level of administration until 2017. The 753 local governments in place since 2018 comprises 6 metropolitan cities, 11 sub-metropolitan cities, 276 municipalities and 460 rural municipalities. Nepal has an estimated population of 30.2 million. According to the United Nations Development Programme, the country ranks 142 out of 189 in the human development index and the country's GDP per capita was estimated to be USD 870 in 2021.

The country still faces challenges with its health sector workforce as there was a ratio of 9 "physicians, nurses and midwives" per 10,000 population, which is below WHO's recommended average health workforce ratio of 23 per 10,000 population.<sup>3</sup> The national health system consists of the public sector made up of all the government-owned health facilities, as well as the private sector. The provision of health services in Nepal is decentralised to provinces and districts, who are responsible for taking the lead in managing and administering health services.

### 3.2 Gavi's funding arrangements in Nepal

Gavi's support to MoHP is received in a bank account held at the Nepal Rastra Bank (Central Bank of Nepal) under the name of Financial Comptroller General Office (FCGO). The same bank account is used to receive funding from other development partners and donors so Gavi's funds are comingled. Upon receiving Gavi funds in a Government bank account, FCGO issues a "fund release letter" to the concerned offices/ local bodies. The fund release letter is an official document which communicates the availability of funds and provides provinces with the authorisation to spend these resources on budgeted activities. Similarly, Provinces also issue a fund release letter to their respective districts. Additionally, Gavi supports some activities directly through its partners UNICEF and WHO.

Gavi also provided financial support to the MoHP through the Joint Financing Agreement (pooled fund) cofinanced with other funding partners including FCDO, World Bank and KfW. This Joint Financing Agreement was signed in December 2016 as a mechanism contributing towards funding the Nepal Health Sector Strategy – itself being a wider national strategy which brings together other partners such as, UNICEF, WHO, USAID, KOICA and UNFPA. The support is received in a pool fund account held at the Nepal Rastra Bank (Central Bank of Nepal) under the name of Financial Comptroller General Office (FCGO).

#### 3.3 Good Practices

After our initial review in June 2022, in October 2023 Gavi engaged the services of an Assurance Provider (AP). This AP's objectives were to: bring greater efficiency to the management of Gavi grants in Nepal; strengthen the country's compliance with Gavi's financial management requirements; provide fiduciary risk assurance; and contribute towards enhancing the national staff's financial management and reporting capacity. The audit team noted that (i) Outstanding activities including the annual financial audits for 2016 to 2022 were completed as part of the initial capacity building activities, which resulted in better coordination and engagement with the Auditor General, and (ii) Engagement between the provinces, FWD and DoHS in financial reporting and financial management improved.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Global Health Observatory data repository, WHO

### 4. Audit Issues

### 4.1 Budget and Financial Management

### 4.1.1 Inadequate systematic budget and work plan monitoring and reporting system

#### Context and criteria

Paragraph 16 of Annex 2 of the Partnership Framework Agreement (PFA) states that: "The Government's use of Gavi's vaccine and cash support is subject to strict performance monitoring. Gavi seeks to use the Government reports and existing country-level mechanisms to monitor performance. The Government shall monitor and report on the use of vaccines and related supplies and the funds provided by Gavi stating the progress made towards achieving the objectives of the Programme(s) during the preceding year by submitting the Annual Progress Report(s). The Government shall also share their internal management reports on the use of funds on a quarterly or periodic basis with Gavi. The Government shall also submit all documents and reports that are required to be submitted as part of the Annual Progress Reports and country applications. For certain cash support, Gavi shall monitor and review annually the progress made in the Country towards the funded objectives of the Programme(s) by participating in the annual health sector review through existing country-level mechanisms. The Government shall submit all documents relevant to annual health sector reviews as requested by Gavi."

Included in the GMRs from 2020, MoHP/DoHS is required to submit financial reports for each of the Gavi grants (except those channelled through the pool fund) in line with Gavi's Guidelines on Financial Management and Audit Requirements. This will include ensuring proper linking of activities to budgets and source of funding at all levels of spending, appropriate adjustment of advances to lower levels and staff from reported expenditure and clear consolidation of reports at the national level, including those for grants channelled through Alliance Partners. The GMRs require that Gavi funding to provinces be budgeted for as conditional grants through the federal level. Detailed guidelines on the grants should be sent to provinces by the federal level within two months of the start of every fiscal year.

Paragraph 8.1(b) of the PFA states that: "This Agreement constitutes a legal, valid and binding obligation of the Government, enforceable against it in accordance with its terms. The activities under the Programmes are operated in compliance with applicable laws."

Section 73(2) of the Financial Procedures and Fiscal Responsibility Regulations, 2077 requires that "In connection with foreign assistance, the project or office shall be required to submit reports to the superior office as aid in-kind, direct payment, turn key, technical and other assistance as well as reports on reimbursement of sums. expenditure headings, donor agencies, types of sources, and method of payments."

#### Condition

The audit team noted the following areas for improvement:

*Inclusion of provinces in the annual budgeting, planning and analysis processes:* There was insufficent evidence to demonstrate the involvement of the provinces and districts in the budgeting and planning process. Additionally, analysis procedures comparing budgets to actual expenditure were not completed at the subnational levels, as based on the units visited by the team.

**Budget monitoring was insufficient:** Gavi grants are managed centrally through an accounting system called CGAS and subnationally through the TABUCS systems. The CGAS system can produce a budget versus actual analysis report. However, FCGO did not monitor the budgets through the system or establish any suitable process to ensure that the expenditures reported by the provinces were as per the approved work plans. As such, FCGO did not investigate variances in expenditures from work plans.

Inadequate monitoring of workplan: There was no evidence to demonstrate that periodic monitoring of workplans was undertaken or discussed in the governance and oversight structures like the ICC or by the senior management of DoHS, to ensure that activities were timely implemented and grant funds were absorbed. This was due to a lack of reporting by sub-national level, compounded by the manual reporting systems at health offices, and practical difficulties associated in actually consolidating the activity/grant-wise reports.

#### Recommendation 1

DoHS should ensure that:

- Provinces are appropriately involved in the planning process and that this process is documented:
- A process of budget monitoring is instituted both at national and provincial level, and that budget monitoring is done for all grants; and
- Expenditure is reviewed by DoHS against the approved workplans and any variances investigated.

| Root cause   | Management co | omments                             |
|--|---------------|-------------------------------------|
| <ul> <li>Recent DoHS staffing changes associated with the federalisation process (including several new and inexperienced staff), coupled with inadequate capacity building at subnational levels.</li> <li>Inadequate follow-up and oversight to ensure the implementation of relevant financial management practices and accountability mechanisms, so as to hold staff and relevant authorities accountable.</li> </ul> |               | rement responses - <u>Annex 8</u>   |
| <ul> <li>Risk / Impact / Implications</li> <li>The inadequate monitoring of budget utilisation, postpones the chance to possibly reprogramme funding, translating into missed opportunities for the country.</li> <li>There is a risk that programme objectives might be delayed or not-achieved, as some planned activities may not be completed.</li> </ul>  |               | Deadline / Timetable<br>See Annex 8 |

### 4.1.2 Gaps in financial management resulted in questioned expenditures

#### Context and criteria

The signed Partnership Framework Agreement (PFA) (under Paragraph 23 of annex 2) requires that "the Government shall maintain accurate and separate accounts and records of each of the Programmes prepared in accordance with internationally recognised standards that are sufficient to establish and verify accurately the costs and expenditures under the Programmes. The Government shall maintain such accounts and records and any other supporting documents evidencing expenses made with Gavi's funds according to the Country's fiscal requirements for a minimum of five (5) years after the completion of a Programme. In the event where Gavi provided funds are pooled with other sources of funding, accounts and records will equally be maintained for the pooled funds."

The signed PFA, (under clause 15) requires that "the Gavi funds provided under this Agreement shall not be used to pay any taxes, customs, duties, toll or other charges imposed on the importation of vaccines and related supplies. The Government shall use its reasonable efforts to set up appropriate mechanism to exempt from duties and taxes all purchases made locally and internationally with Gavi funds."

Paragraph 20 of Annex 2 of the PFA defines Misuse of funds and supplies. Sub-paragraph 20.1 of Annex 2 of the PFA states that "in respect of all funds and vaccines and related supplies provided to the Government under the Programme(s), the Government shall comply with obligations and requirements on the use of such funds and supplies, including the following:

- The Government shall use the funds and vaccines and related supplies received from Gavi under a Programme for the sole purpose of carrying out the Programme Activities of such Programme.
- The Government shall ensure that there is no misuse or waste of, or corrupt, illegal, or fraudulent activities involving the funds and vaccines and related supplies; and
- The Government shall ensure that all expenses relating to the use or application of funds are properly evidenced with supporting documentation sufficient to permit Gavi to verify such expenses."

#### Condition

Questioned expenditure amounting to USD 0.31 million – The audit team reviewed a sample of transactions at the: DoHS central level, provincial offices and district offices, which were incurred during the audit period (1 January 2017 to 31 December 2021). The DoHS reported expenditures totalling USD 7.17 million of which 22% (USD 1.6 million) was selected for review. Overall, the audit team questioned expenditures totalling USD 0.31 million due to either the inadequacy of supporting documents, irregular expenditure, or ineligible and unsupported expenditures, as shown below:

Table 6: Expenditures questioned by the audit team in NPR and USD

| Location          | Expenditures<br>reviewed<br>(a) | Voucher<br>verified<br>(b) | Adequately<br>supported<br>(c) | Inadequate<br>(d) | Irregular<br>(e) | Ineligible<br>(f) | Unsupported for<br>vouchers<br>verified<br>(g) | Unsupporte<br>d items (a-b)<br>(h) | Expenditures<br>questioned<br>(= d+e+f+g+h) | Expendiures<br>questioned<br>(USD) |
|-------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|------------------|-------------------|--|------------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|
| НО                | 1,172,900                       | 1,172,900                  | 737,760                        |                   |                  | 435,140           |  |                                    | 435,140                                     | 3,626                              |
| Koshi             | 44,725,067                      | 42,449,983                 | 40,722,474                     | 1,154,725         | 0                | 476,184           | 96,600   | 2,277,723                          | 4,005,232                                   | 33,377                             |
| Sudurpashc<br>him | 30,767,939                      | 30,024,534                 | 29,129,938                     | 556,283           | 30,000           | 196,093           | 112,220  | 1,216,438                          | 2,111,034                                   | 17,592                             |
| Bagmati           | 51,277,705                      | 48,632,635                 | 43,080,931                     | 32,700            | 0                | 2,193,496         | 3,325,508                                      | 3,003,121                          | 8,554,825                                   | 71,290                             |
| Lumbini           | 29,049,163                      | 28,610,441                 | 23,887,900                     | 4,567,902         | 0                | 150,039           | 4,600  | 645,302                            | 5,367,843                                   | 44,732                             |
| Madhesh           | 33,835,871                      | 29,149,626                 | 23,646,048                     | 3,178,810         | 24,695           | 353,234           | 1,946,839                                      | 4,804,994                          | 10,308,572                                  | 85,905                             |
| OAGN              |                                 |                            |                                |                   |                  | 1,205,237         |  |                                    | 1,205,237                                   | 10,044                             |
| Total (NPR)       | 190,828,645                     | 180,040,119                | 161,205,051                    | 9,490,420         | 54,695           | 5,009,423         | 5,485,767                                      | 11,947,578                         | 31,987,883                                  | ·                                  |
| Equivalent in USD | 1,580,464                       | 1,490,560                  | 1,337,227                      | 79,087            | 456              | 41,745            | 45,715   | 99,563                             |   | 266,566                            |

#### Recommendation 2

We recommend that MoHP in consultation with provincial government:

- Conduct regular training of the provincial and district finance staff on financial management and compliance with grant management requirements.
- Ensures that all expenditures are adequately supported with adequate and accurate supporting documents, as well as instituting a robust process for verifying expenditures.
- Ensures that Gavi grants are not used to incur VAT charges, and that a mechanism to identify and track any VAT paid from Gavi grants is put in place.
- Ensure that regular supervisions to the sub-national level take place, to review the provinces and districts' financial management practices, including review of their financial reports and corresponding activities. Bank reconciliation statements and relevant journal vouchers (with a corresponding schedule of balances per funding source) are to be

Unsupported expenditures (USD 45,715 + USD 99,563 = USD 145,278) — This amount is comprised of: (i) Transactions reported by the DoHS and the provinces / district offices for which the audit team did not receive any vouchers / or supporting documents amounting to USD 45,715, and (ii) Differences between the expenditures reported by the respective office and the value of the payment voucher provided amounting to USD 99,563.

**Inadequately supported expenditures (USD 79,087)** — Where the quality of documentation maintained to support transactions related to implementing various programme activities, was inadequate. For example, there were no attendance sheets provided or in the absence of appropriate attendance sheets, supplementary supporting documentation such as an activity report or supervision report was not available, to confirm that the activities budgeted for took place. As a consequence, the audit team was unable to provide reasonable assurance that the expenditures were related to Gavi-funded activities.

*Irregular expenditures (USD 456)* – Where the quality of documentation in support of transactions related to implementing various programme activities was not appropriate. For example, log sheets were not available for fuel receipts.

*Ineligible expenditures (USD 41,745)* – These ineligible transactions relate to where funds were used for activities that were not included in the approved budgets (USD 28,430) and a VAT amount of USD 13,315. The MoHP was unable to present the relevant VAT exemptions for procurements using Gavi funds as required by the GMRs. Similarly, the FCGO had no mechanism in place to track what VAT was paid in relation to donor-funded activities.

Questioned procurement expenditures - NPR 5,004,628 (USD 41,705) – In addition to the expenditures noted above, the audit team selected five procurement transactions from the statement of expenditures submitted to Gavi for the fiscal year 2017-18 (2074-75) for review amounting to NPR 7,953,974 (USD 66,283). The MoHP and related subnational levels were unable to present procurement documents including bidding documents, evaluation reports and contracts for procurements amounting to USD 41,705 to the audit team and were questioned as below:

Table 7: Unsupported procurement expenditures

| Code    | Particulars Particulars   | Amount NPR | Amount USD |
|---------|---|------------|------------|
| 3708044 | Power back up voltage stabiliser Servo Type with 100% copper, Voltage from 90 to 260 in 75 district | 2,398,078  | 19,984     |
|         | cold room and 6 medical stores for cold chain and vaccine management                                |            |            |
| 3708044 | Procurement and installation of 5 KVA solar hybrid for power supply in high mountain district cold  | 2,606,550  | 21,721     |
|         | room (5 set)  |            |            |
|         | Total   | 5,004,628  | 41,705     |

- reviewed and signed off by the senior management team, to ensure accuracy and completeness.
- Use a standard template when preparing fund release letters, so that pertinent details are consistently included which could be helpful for the province / district to account for Gavi grants at various levels as well as help during the time of liquidation.
- Roll out computerised accounting systems across provincial and health offices for use in grant accounting and reporting.

#### Root cause

- Non-compliance with the Partnership Framework Agreement, resulting in ineffective financial procedures and the questioning of expenditures, as a consequence.
- Inadequate controls over the review of expenditures coupled with inadequate document management.
- There was no evidence that financial management guidelines were shared at the sub-national level on fund disbursements and clarifying what accountabilities were required for maintenance of supporting documents.
- There was limited financial supervision from the DoHS to the provinces, and a lack of review by the FCGO of the expenditures reported by the provinces.
- Due to staffing changes as part of the federalisation process, new finance personnel were recruited, particularly within the provinces and at subsidiary levels. Many of the incumbents are not yet adequately trained or experienced.
- A lack of traceability of funds disbursed to province and district levels, due to which the expenditures incurred are not always categorised to the correct grant at the sub-national level.

### Management comments

See detailed management responses - Annex 8

| •  | Multiple financial management systems are being used across the MoHP's administrative structures without any integration, which leads to difficulty in reporting and reconciliation of funding sources/grants.   |                      |                      |
|----|--|----------------------|----------------------|
| •  | Delays in justifying advances, can result in inadequate documentation being maintained or liquidations being incomplete.   |                      |                      |
| Ri | isk / Impact / Implications  | Responsibility       | Deadline / Timetable |
| •  | Loss of trust and confidence in the implementing entities and the government, which can have a negative impact on future funding from Gavi and other donors.   | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS | See Annex 8          |
| •  | Non-compliance with the Partnership Framework Agreement and grant agreement, which led to ineffective financial procedures and resulted in questioned costs. This may indicate that Gavi funds not being utilised effectively and efficiently, and there was a risk of financial mismanagement including fraud. This could result in termination of funding in some instances. |                      |                      |
| •  | Poor health outcomes of the targeted population, as the funds intended for the vaccination programme may not be utilised optimally due to inadequate financial procedures and controls.  |                      |                      |
| •  | Payment of VAT makes programme funds unavailable for implementation of programme activities.   |                      |                      |
| •  | Questioned expenditures totalling approximately to USD 0.31 million (i.e., inadequately supported, irregular, unsupported and ineligible expenditures)   |                      |                      |

#### 4.2 Assurance Provider Framework

### 4.2.1 Strengthening of Assurance Provider mechanism

#### Context and criteria

In August 2023, Gavi appointed an assurance provider for a period up to December 2025. This provider's objectives were to: bring greater efficiency to the management of Gavi grants in Nepal; strengthen the country's compliance with Gavi's financial management requirements; provide fiduciary risk assurance; and contribute towards enhancing the national and provincial staff's financial management and reporting capacity. In addition, the assurance provider's work is to be governed by a suitable assurance framework developed by Gavi. The scope of the AP's duties extends to all Gavi grants. Its terms of reference indicates the list of activities to be undertaken by the AP, including the overarching objective of enabling a more stable and sustainable financial management state in country, to help the country navigate through transition away from the AP's supporting role.

The AP needs to work closely with Gavi's Portfolio Financial Management (PFM) focal point, to ensure that: budgeting; financial reporting; cash management and disbursements; Audits; and related compliance requirements, are consistently achieved in a timely manner.

#### Condition

Gavi has appointed an assurance provider (AP) for Nepal for approximately two years, to support the MoHP in strengthening its budgeting and financial management procedures. The audit team reviewed the AP's terms of reference and scope of work, its approved work plan, and the three quarterly reports it submitted to Gavi (between August 2023 and April 2024) and noted the following:

Based on the AP's scope of work, it developed a work plan for the period till December 2024. This work plan was validated by Gavi's PFM unit and execution is proceeding accordingly. To date, up until April 2024, the AP has submitted three reports. The audit team undertook a review of the terms of reference, work plan and the reports submitted to date. Examples of key activities not yet undertaken by the AP include, as follows (refer to **Annex** 6 for detailed scope of work and status):

- While the AP reviewed the administrative, financial and accounting procedures manual, their observations did not include recommendations or an implementation plan to be discharged by the DoHS.
- The review of national DoHS' budget and procurement procedures included in the ToR has not yet started.
- While the AP's ToRs require a review of all the payments, the AP only reviewed a sample as part of its financial management spot checks.
- While the ToRs requires the AP to complete a detailed and comprehensive financial management capacity building plan, this has not been done by April 2024. Instead, the AP developed a training plan based on their past experience as Monitoring Agent. However this training plan has not yet been validated by Gavi, as it needs to be reviewed to ensure that it encompasses a comprehensive capacity building plan.
- The review of counter-fraud mechanism procedures has not yet started.

The audit team also noted that there is a misalignment between the Assurance Provider's terms of reference, approved work plan and actual activities undertaken to date. The audit team therefore concluded that Gavi management needed to review the need of the assurance provider given the current capacity building and technical assistance needs at national and subnational level.

#### Root cause

- The assurance provider mechanism was recently introduced as part of Gavi support to the countries. Gavi is still learning and the AP requirements will continue to evolve as Gavi gains more experience working with assuance providers in countries.
- Misalignment between the the assurance provider's terms of reference, approved work plan and the actual activities being undertaken.

#### Recommendation 3

We recommend that the MOH and the Gavi country program delivery (CPD) team jointly re-evaluate the role of the current appointed provider, as there is a need for additional capacity building and technical assistance at both national and subnational levels. Following this, an assessment should also be done to determine whether the assurance provider function in its current format, is still necessary.

### Management comments

See detailed management responses - Annex 8

| Risk / Impact / In                   | plications  | Responsibility  | Deadline / Timetable |
|--------------------------------------|---|-----------------|----------------------|
| <ul> <li>If the assurance</li> </ul> | provider fails to comply with its terms of reference, this may result in it being ineffective or in it failing to deliver on the full | Gavi Portfolio  | See <u>Annex 8</u>   |
| range of comple                      | mentary fiduciary activities.   | Management team |                      |

#### 4.3 Implementation status of prior audit recommendations

### 4.3.1 Some progress was made in addressing the 2022 programme audit recommendations

#### Context and criteria

Paragraph 15 of Annex 2 of the PFA states that "The Government shall comply with the terms and implement the measures set out in the Financial Management Requirements by the timelines set out in therein."

GMR 2020 states "DoHS (FWD, and MD if applicable) will prepare a plan to follow up on the recommendations made by the internal auditors, external auditors, and Gavi auditors for submission to Gavi and for internal dissemination internally within the MoHP and DoHS. The DoHS will be responsible for monitoring all audit recommendations and a status of the fulfillment or recommendations will be submitted to the ICC and Gavi."

Paragraph 28 of Annex 2 of the PFA states that "GAVI may suspend, in whole or in part, its funding to one or more Programmes to the Country if: the Government has failed to perform any of its obligations under this Agreement and any Decision Letters."

In 2022, Gavi carried out a programme audit of its support to Nepal, proposing recommendations to strengthen controls and mitigate risks. The final audit report was published in April 2024, including an agreed management action plan to be implemented, and for which Gavi's Country Programme Delivery (CPD) team is responsible to follow-up. As a result in April 2024, the Gavi audit team reviewed the MoHP's current progress in implementating its agreed actions, with a focus on those due to be implemented by April 2024. Gavi is responsible for determining the consequences of non-implementation, which ultimately could result in funding suspension or termination.

#### Condition

The prior programme audit report includes 37 agreed management action points. The audit team noted that 26 of them were due to be completed by April 2024. DoHS made some progress in implementing its management actions resulting in 14 out of 26 actions being completed. DoHS decided to postpone 12 of the 26 actions to a future date as the Family Welfare Division (FWD) required coordination with other stakeholders outside of FWD for complete implementation. Thus, although some of the relevant actions were begun by FWD, none of these can be completed, pending the other department completing their corresponding task assigned. Refer to Annex 7 for details on the status for the recommendations.

Examples of key recommendations not yet implemented include:

- Formation of a steering committee responsible for convening a coordination platform, with a mandate to deliberate planning, implementation and monitoring of related aspects of the National Immunisation Programme, including Gavi-funded activities. The committee to include representation from a range of MoHP divisions, from partners and other stakeholders.
- Formation of the proposed Inter-Governmental Coordination Committee to be chaired by the Director General, with appropriate representation from various federal and provincial governments stakeholders, with a mandate to deliberate programme planning, implementation, monitoring and reporting related aspects/challenges of the National Immunisation Programme (including Gavi-funded activities).
- Revision of the ICC's terms of reference, in line with the Immunisation Act and with guidance from the National Immunisation Advisory Committee.
- Preparation of supervision work plans and ToRs, as well as appropriate supervision tools. A system to document monitoring visits and action plans is to be introduced, and the results as well as the action plan will be discussed in staff meetings as well as bi-weekly immunisation meetings on a quarterly basis.
- Vaccine stock counts are to be done every month by the provincial and district stores. Similarry, stock counts to be done every 3 months at the central vaccine store. Appropriate documentation evidencing these counts to be maintained.

#### Recommendation 4

To enhance oversight over the implementation and follow-up of past recommendations, from audits and assessments/ reviews, the MoHP/DoHS management should:

- develop a tracking system at the DoHS operational level which captures all of the recommendations, ranked by priority (high, medium, low). Where recommendations are repeated across several reviews, these should all be included in the tracker with one action and action owner, to help consolidate the appropriate action being taken.
- at the ICC oversight level, develop a dashboard which takes into consideration audit recommendations, and ensure that these are allocated to an action owner with timelines for implementation.
- Include as an ICC meeting agenda item every six months (i.e. semi-annually) a progress report on the status of implementating all recommendations.

| _ |   |  |                       |  |
|---|---|--|-----------------------|--|
|   | By end of FY 2023/24 (2080/81), at least 60 districts should be using the eLMIS for vaccine management.   | Following the ICC's semi-annual endorsement, |                       |  |
|   | • Wastage data is recorded based on a computation of the following data points: vaccines received, vaccines supplied to service points and the coverage | share with Gavi the progress update on the   |                       |  |
|   | achieved. This wastage is to be logged every month in the Health facility monthly recording sheet as well as in the electornic DHIS2 database           | implementatio                                | n of recommendations. |  |
|   | • Where variances between stocks recorded in the eLMIS and the physical count are identified, operationalise an appropriate mechanism to document,      |  |                       |  |
|   | sign and approve how these variances are dealt with.  |  |                       |  |
|   | Developing various guidelines and analytical documents on establishing the quality and use of immunisation data. and                                    |  |                       |  |
|   | <ul> <li>Develop and disseminate SOPs on how to manage the inventory of Gavi-funded asset acquisitions.</li> </ul>                                      |  |                       |  |
|   |   |  |                       |  |
| ļ | The audit team concluded that significant issues remain unaddressed, potentially impacting upon the programme's implementation and performance.         |  |                       |  |
|   | Root cause  | Management co                                | omments               |  |
|   | The following root causes were identified:  |  |                       |  |
|   | There is no mechanism in place to track the implementation of the audit recommendations.  | See detailed management responses - Annex 8  |                       |  |
|   | • Inadequate Inter-agency Coordination Committee (ICC) oversight over the implementation of recommendations.  |  |                       |  |
|   | • Recommendations were not assigned to action owners, responsible for their follow up, and ensure prompt implementation.                                |  |                       |  |
|   | Risk / Impact / Implications  | Responsibility                               | Deadline / Timetable  |  |
|   | • Failure to implement or address audit recommendation could result in suspending Gavi's funding. As a consequence future funding opportunities         | FWD-DoHS                                     | See Annex 8           |  |
|   | could be foregone (as per the signed PFA).  | FAS-DoHS                                     |                       |  |
|   | Outstanding issues from audit and other reviews can result in internal control weaknesses remaining unresolved, undermining programme                   |  |                       |  |
|   | implementation and/ or grant performance.   |  |                       |  |
|   | • Insufficient or inadequate oversight may impact on the programme's ability to achieve its stated objectives.  |  |                       |  |

### 4.3.2 Grant management requirements are still outstanding

#### Context and criteria

Paragraph 15 of Annex 2 of the PFA states that "The Government shall comply with the terms and implement the measures set out in the Financial Management Requirements by the timelines set out in therein."

Paragraph 28 of Annex 2 of the PFA states that "GAVI may suspend, in whole or in part, its funding to one or more Programmes to the Country if: the Government has failed to perform any of its obligations under this Agreement and any Decision Letters."

In 2016, Gavi carried out a programme capacity assessment (PCA) of the MoHP, covering the following areas: financial management – including an evaluation of the funding mechanism – and vaccine/cold chain management. In 2020, the PCA process concluded, resulting in the MoHP and Gavi agreeing on a set of grant management requirements (GMRs).

#### Condition

Delays in implementation of grant management requirements (GMRs): Five of the nine GMRs were implemented. The four pending GMRs include:

- Revision of the Interagency Coordination Committee (ICC) TORs to include the mandate, membership (including composition, selection and rules), meeting rules, decision making rules, support functions, roles and responsibilities including those of the ICC secretariat, TORs for subcommittees or working groups, as applicable
- Implementation and roll out of a suitable integrated financial management system across spending units at federal, provincial and health offices. to include at a minimum, the following:
  - Integration with budget information systems (LMBIS, Provincial LMBIS (PLMBIS)) and treasury management systems (Treasury Single Account (TSA) and State TSA systems)
  - Module for tracking of advances to lower levels and to staff, with ability to provide ageing analysis for outstanding advances
  - Coding of budgets and expenses as well as generating financial reports in line with Gavi Guidelines on Financial Management and Audit Requirements.
  - Assets management module
- Maintenance of a consolidated and comprehensive Fixed Asset Register (FAR) for all assets, including but not limited to cold chain equipment, vehicles and IT equipment procured using Gavi support, and to include annual verification at all levels.
- Oversight for financial management transactions over Gavi supported programmes at federal, provincial and district levels.

#### Recommendation 5

To enhance oversight over the implementation of the remaining four pending GMRs, the MoHP/DoHS management should:

- develop a tracking system at the DoHS operational level and ensure all GMR are captured, ranked by priority (i.e. high, medium, low).
- At the ICC oversight level, develop a dashboard which takes into consideration GMRs and that these are allocated to an action owner with timelines for implementation.
- Include as an ICC meeting agenda item every six months (i.e. semi-annually) a progress report on the status of implementating all recommendations.
- Following the ICC's semi-annual endorsement, share with Gavi the progress update on the implementation of recommendations.

#### Root cause

The following root causes were identified:

- including lack of visibility at senior leadership levels.
- Inadequate ICC oversight over the implementation of recommendations.

funding opportunities could be foregone (As stated in the signed PFA).

## Recommendations were not assigned to action owners and there is no mechanism in place to track the implementation of the GMRs,

- Risk / Impact / Implications • Failure to implement and comply with the GMRs, could result in delaying, suspending or terminating Gavi's funding. As a consequence future
- Insufficient or inadequate oversight may impact on the programme's ability to achieve its stated objectives.

### Management comments

See detailed management responses - Annex 8

### Responsibility FWD-DoHS **FAS-DoHS**

Deadline / Timetable See Annex 8

### 5. Annexes

### Annex 1 - Acronyms

AWPB Annual Work Plan

AP Assurance Provider

CIP Costed Improvement Plan (linked to the EVM)

DTCO District Treasury Control Office

DoHS Department of Health Services

eLMIS Electronic Logistics Management Information System

EVM Effective Vaccine Management

FAR Fixed Asset Register

FCGO Financial Comptroller General Office

FWD Family Welfare Division

**GMR** Grant Management Requirements

HF Health Facility

HMIS Health Management Information Systems

ICC Inter agency Coordination Committee

MA Monitoring Agent

MoHP Ministry of Health and Population

NPR Nepalese Rupee

PAMS Provincial Asset Management System

USD United States Dollars

VIG Vaccine Introduction Grant

### Annex 2 – Methodology

Gavi's Audit and Investigations (A&I) audits are conducted in accordance to the Institute of Internal Auditors' ("the Institute") mandatory guidance which includes the Core Principles for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing, the definition of Internal Auditing, the Code of Ethics, and the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing (Standards). This mandatory guidance constitutes principles of the fundamental requirements for the professional practice of internal auditing and for evaluating the effectiveness of the audit activity's performance. The Institute of Internal Auditors' Practice Advisories, Practice Guides, and Position Papers are also be adhered to as applicable to guide operations. In addition, A&I staff will adhere to A&I's standard operating procedures manual.

The principles and details of the A&I's audit approach are described in its Board-approved Terms of Reference and Audit Manual and specific terms of reference for each engagement. These documents help our auditors to provide high quality professional work, and to operate efficiently and effectively. They help safeguard the independence of the A&I's auditors and the integrity of their work. The A&I's Audit Manual contains detailed instructions for carrying out its audits, in line with the appropriate standards and expected quality.

In general, the scope of A&I's work extends not only to the Secretariat but also to the programmes and activities carried out by Gavi's grant recipients and partners. More specifically, its scope encompasses the examination and evaluation of the adequacy and effectiveness of Gavi's governance, risk management processes, system of internal control, and the quality of performance in carrying out assigned responsibilities to achieve stated goals and objectives.

### Annex 3 - Definitions: opinion, audit rating and prioritisation

### A. Overall Audit Opinion

The audit team ascribes an audit rating for each area/section reviewed, and the summation of these audit ratings underpins the overall audit opinion. The audit ratings and overall opinion are ranked according to the following scale:

| Effective                     | <b>No issues or few minor issues noted</b> . Internal controls, governance and risk management processes are adequately designed, consistently well implemented, and effective to provide reasonable assurance that the objectives will be met.                                      |
|-------------------------------|--|
| Partially Effective           | <b>Moderate issues noted.</b> Internal controls, governance and risk management practices are adequately designed, generally well implemented, but one or a limited number of issues were identified that may present a moderate risk to the achievement of the objectives.          |
| Needs significant improvement | One or few significant issues noted. Internal controls, governance and risk management practices have some weaknesses in design or operating effectiveness such that, until they are addressed, there is not yet reasonable assurance that the objectives are likely to be met.      |
| Ineffective                   | Multiple significant and/or (a) material issue(s) noted. Internal controls, governance and risk management processes are not adequately designed and/or are not generally effective. The nature of these issues is such that the achievement of objectives is seriously compromised. |

### B. Issue Rating

For ease of follow up and to enable management to focus effectively in addressing the issues in our report, we have classified the issues arising from our review in order of significance: High, Medium and Low. In ranking the issues between 'High', 'Medium' and 'Low', we have considered the relative importance of each matter, taken in the context of both quantitative and qualitative factors, such as the relative magnitude and the nature and effect on the subject matter. This is in accordance with the Committee of Sponsoring Organisations of the Treadway Committee (COSO) guidance and the Institute of Internal Auditors standards.

| Rating | Implication   |
|--------|---|
|        | At least one instance of the criteria described below is applicable to the issue raised:  |
|        | <ul> <li>Controls mitigating high inherent risks or strategic business risks are either inadequate or<br/>ineffective.</li> </ul>   |
| High   | <ul> <li>The issues identified may result in a risk materialising that could either have: a major impact on<br/>delivery of organisational objectives; major reputation damage; or major financial consequences.</li> </ul>             |
|        | <ul> <li>The risk has either materialised or the probability of it occurring is very likely and the mitigations put in place do not mitigate the risk.</li> </ul>   |
|        | Fraud and unethical behaviour including management override of key controls.  |
|        | Management attention is required as a matter of priority.   |
|        | At least one instance of the criteria described below is applicable to the issue raised:  |
|        | Controls mitigating medium inherent risks are either inadequate or ineffective.   |
| Medium | <ul> <li>The issues identified may result in a risk materialising that could either have: a moderate impact or<br/>delivery of organisational objectives; moderate reputation damage; or moderate financial<br/>consequences</li> </ul> |
|        | The probability of the risk occurring is possible and the mitigations put in place moderately reduce the risk.  |
|        | Management action is required within a reasonable time period.  |
|        | At least one instance of the criteria described below is applicable to the issue raised:  |
|        | Controls mitigating low inherent risks are either inadequate or ineffective.  |
| Low    | The Issues identified could have a minor negative impact on the risk and control environment.   |
|        | The probability of the risk occurring is unlikely to happen.  |
|        | Corrective action is required as appropriate.   |

## Annex 4 - Sites visited by the audit team

| Provinces                 | Districts                             |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Province 1 – Koshi        | Morang, Sunsari                       |
| Province 2 – Madhesh      | Dhanusha, Mahottari                   |
| Province 3 – Bagmati      | Kathmandu, Lalitpur, BhaktaPur, Kavre |
| Province 5 – Lumbini      | Palpa, Rupandehi                      |
| Province 7 - Sudurpaschim | Kailali, Kanchanpur                   |

## Annex 5 - Expenditures questioned by the audit team (amounts in NPR)

#### **Federal Level**

| FY/Voucher n° | Value date | Details   | Amount    | Ineligible | Comment  |
|---------------|------------|---|-----------|------------|--|
| 2018-19/8     | 26/06/75   | Salary of contractual employees such as computer operator, ha. Sa. Cha. And support staff | 296,100   | 32,460     | 1. Salary has also been paid to employee of designation that are not budgeted in AWP. As per AWP, salary of 2 helpers were budgeted, however salary of 3 helpers are charged to GAVI. Hence salary of 1 helper which was not budgeted in AWP is ineligible.  2. Payment slip has been acknowledged by 2 employees out of 8 employees only.  3. Payment Slip lacks information of bank accounts of 2 employees. This signifies payment of salary may have been paid in cash.  4. Copy of DTCO(District Treasury Controller Office) certified transfer advice of salary is not present with the voucher. |
| 2018-19/45    | 12/11/75   | Salary of contractual employees such as computer operator, ha. Sa. Cha. And support staff | 876,800   | 402,680    | 1. Salary paid to employee with designation not as per mentioned in AWP. As per AWP, budget is allocated for computer operator 3, Driver 5 and sweeper 1; however, salary has been charged to GAVI fund for Program coordinator 4, Driver 5 and sweeper 2)  2. Copy of DTCO(District Treasury Controller Office) certified transfer advice of salary was not present with the voucher.   |
| TOTAL         |            |   | 1,172,900 | 435,140    |  |

#### **PHD Dhankuta**

| FY                | Voucher n° | Value date     | Transaction description   | Amount    | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                                 |
|-------------------|------------|----------------|---|-----------|------------|--|
| 2017/18 (2074/75) | 30         |                | Immunisation Programme 4 Days Training                              | 1,772,150 | 11,688     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |
| 2017/18 (2074/75) | 30         |                | Immunisation Programme 4 Days Training                              | 1,787,089 | 6,109      | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |
| 2019/20 (2076/77) | 5          | 7 Magh 2076    | Advance settlement of Udesh Shrestha against V.N. 3 for programme   | 1,332,055 | 43,743     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |
|                   |            |                | related to TCV and Rota   |           |            |  |
| 2021/22 (2078/79) | 15         | 7 Baishak 2079 | Typhoid Campaign Shubharanma programme TDA and Fuel Bill            | 122,053   | 7,553      | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |
| 2021/22 (2078/79) | 13         | 23 Chitra 2078 | Typhoid khop Training hall bill, Press orientation, stationary bill | 1,000,000 | 27,075     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |
|                   | TOTAL      |                |   | 6,013,347 | 96,168     |  |

#### **PHLMC Morang**

| FY      | Voucher n° | Amount    | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                                 |  |  |  |
|---------|------------|-----------|------------|------------|--|--|--|--|
| 2074/75 | 5          | 97,999    |            | 11,274     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 8          | 496,861   |            | 57,161     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 5          | 95,264    |            | 10,959     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 6          | 273,872   |            | 31,507     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 9          | 97,257    |            | 11,188     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 13         | 14,125    |            | 1,377      | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 16         | 45,870    |            | 4,141      | Vat amount has been categorised as ineligible                    |  |  |  |
| 2074/75 | 17         | 63,975    |            | 5,070      | Vat amount has been categorised as ineligible                    |  |  |  |
| 2076/77 | 1          | 197,550   | 177,025    |            | 1. Travel claim sheet not present                                |  |  |  |
|         |            |           |            |            | 2. Travel allowance acknowledgement reciept not present          |  |  |  |
| 2076/77 | 19         | 263,150   | 132,200    |            | 1. Travel claim sheet not present                                |  |  |  |
|         |            |           |            |            | 2. Travel allowance acknowledgement reciept not present          |  |  |  |
| 2078/79 | 66         | 99,892    |            | 11,492     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
| 2078/79 | 48         | 399,930   |            | 46,009     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible |  |  |  |
|         | TOTAL      | 2,145,745 | 309,225    | 190,178    |  |  |  |  |

### **Morang Health Office**

| FY      | Voucher n° | Value date | Transaction description                                   | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|---------|------------|------------|---|-----------|------------|-------------|--|
| 2076/77 | 57         | 24.01.2077 | Advance settlement - Dadura Rubela                        | 576,900   | 24,000     |             | Daily attendance sheets of Volunteer and Vacccinators is not attached and no alternative evidence available to support expenditure                       |
| 2076/77 | 73         | 2077/02/30 | Programme Expense related to Rubella and Dadura<br>Survey | 96,600    |            | 96,600      | There were no documents related to GAVI expenditure  |
| 2078/79 | 75         | 2079.03.31 | Programme Expense   | 6,000,000 | 206,500    |             | Travel allowance paid to volunteers as there was no attandence sheet attached to voucher and no alternative expenditure available to support expenditure |
|         | TOTAL      |            |   | 6,673,500 | 230,500    | 96,600      |  |

#### Sunsari Health Office

| FY                | Transaction description   | Amount    | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|-------------------|---|-----------|------------|------------|--|
| 2019/20 (2076/77) | Operational Costs of MR Campaign                                | 742,460   |            | 1,950      | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible         |
| 2019/20 (2076/77) | Travel costs of vaccinators for MR Campaign                     | 615,000   | 615,000    |            | Attendance sheet of vaccinators not attached and no alternative evidence |
|                   |   |           |            |            | available to confirm expenditure   |
| 2021/22 (2078/79) | FID Programme expenses  | 1,089,851 |            | 77,460     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible         |
| 2021/22 (2078/79) | TCV Campaign: District level Orientation and Microplanning      | 1,253,113 |            | 78,656     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible         |
| 2021/22 (2078/79) | TCV Campaign - Vaccinator and FCHV travel costs, safe disposal, | 2,385,200 |            | 31,772     | VAT amount included in expenditiure is categorised as ineligible         |
|                   | monitoring and supervision, vaccine logistic transpiration      |           |            |            |  |
|                   | Total   | 6,085,624 | 615,000    | 189,838    |  |

### Kathmandu Health Office

| Financial Year    | Voucher no. | Value date | Transaction description  | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning  |
|-------------------|-------------|------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|---|
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 53          | 2079.03.17 | Syringe and injection  | 49,539    |            |             | 2,639      | VAT amount claimed from Gavi Fund on syringe purchase.  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 53          | 2079.03.17 | Advertisement Expenses   | 75,400    |            |             | 8,642      | VAT amount claimed from Gavi Fund.  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 55          | 2079.03.20 | Travel and Daily Allowance   | 49,650    | 10,000     |             |            | For travel allowance (NPR 10000) in "Journalist Interaction Program", signature in attendance sheet and payment receipt do not match completely for 10 participants. The 5 person for whom signature matched were government employees.                             |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 55          | 2079.03.20 | Reporting Allowance  | 3,000     |            | 2,000       |            | No report available regarding report preparation allowance of NRs. 2000 for two programs "Journalist Interaction Program" and "Orientation Program for District Vaccination Co-ordination" however report preparation allowance has been paid to Ms. Anjana Khadka. |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 55          | 2079.03.20 | Vaccine Carrier Bag  | 69,156    |            |             | 7,956      | VAT amount claimed from Gavi Fund.  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 63          | 2079.03.20 | Report Preparation Allowance   | 1,000     |            | 1,000       |            | Report not attached for Teacher's Orientation Program.  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 87          | 32.03.2079 | Consumables (Maks, sanitisers)   | 37,000    | 5,000      |             |            | No name mentioned in the invoice.   |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 87          | 32.03.2079 | Hall Rent Charges  | 380,000   |            |             | 43,716     | VAT claimed as expenses from Gavi Fund.   |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 99          |            | Stationery and other expenses  | 13,000    |            | 3,060       |            | -No invoice for the stationery purchase and other expenses for the program held-Seminar on 1 day orientation of vaccination held on 2076.08.17  |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 49          | 31.03.2077 | M/R Vaccine Campaign   | 120,000   |            | 120,000     |            | Health office could not provide the supporting documents for the relevant voucher.  |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 48          | 31.03.2077 | Training on first dose of Rota<br>Vaccination and Cleaniness<br>Promotion Campaign | 282,750   |            | 282,750     |            | Health office could not provide the supporting documents for the relevant voucher.  |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 47          | 31.03.2077 | MR Vaccination Training  | 1,215,275 |            | 1,215,275   |            | Health office could not provide the supporting documents for the relevant voucher.  |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 46          | 31.03.2077 | Allowance for Volunteers and Vaccinators   | 992,500   |            | 992,500     |            | Health office could not provide the supporting documents for the relevant voucher.  |
|                   |             |            | Total  | 3,288,270 | 15,000     | 2,616,585   | 62,953     |   |

### **Lalitpur Health Office**

| Financial Year    | Voucher<br>no. | Value date | Transaction description                              | Amount  | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|-------------------|----------------|------------|--|---------|------------|--|
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 50             | 2079.03.18 | Stationery Expenses                                  | 57,724  | 6,640      | VAT Claimed from Gavi Fund.  |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 35             | 2077.03.28 | Broadcasting charge                                  | 54,910  | 1,950      | VAT Claimed as expense   |
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 35             | 2077.03.28 | Purchase and Transportation charge of medicines      | 124,015 | 2,015      | VAT claimed as expense   |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 1              | 2074.07.30 | Puchase of machinery (2 KVA servovoltage stabiliser) | 50,000  | 5,752      | -No other supportings were available to confirm that the machinery was used for Gavi related projectTotal budget for machinery purchase from Gavi was NRs. 115,000VAT amount claimed from Gavi Fund. |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 3              | 2074.09.13 | Purchase of machinery (Dell Desktop)                 | 65,000  | 7,478      | VAT amount claimed from Gavi Fund.   |
|                   |                |            | Total  | 351,649 | 23,835     |  |

### **Bhaktapur Health Office**

| Financial Year    | Voucher no. | Value date | Transaction description                         | Amount  | Inadequate | Unsupported | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                         |
|-------------------|-------------|------------|---|---------|------------|-------------|--|
| 2078-79           |             |            | Payment to vaccinators                          | 17,700  | 17,700     |             | No attendance sheet or alternative evidence available to |
| (2021-22)         | 81          | 2079.03.22 | Fayinetic to vaccillators                       |         |            | -           | ensure that the expenditure was incurred.                |
|                   |             |            | FIPV orientation - one day training (payment of | 246,000 |            | 246,000     |  |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 174         | 2075.03.18 | allowances to the volunteers, participants)     |         | -          |             | No supporting document attached in file                  |
|                   |             |            | Transportation of medicines                     | 80,000  |            | 80,000      |  |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 174         | 2075.03.18 |   |         | -          |             | No supporting document attached in file                  |
|                   |             |            | Advance for program exp.                        | 250,000 |            | 250,000     |  |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 175         | 2075.03.32 |   |         | -          |             | No supporting document attached in file                  |
|                   |             |            | Advance for monitoring and supervision          | 52,000  |            | 52,000      |  |
|                   |             |            |   |         | -          |             | No supporting document attached in file                  |
|                   |             |            | Total   | 645,700 | 17,700     | 628,000     |  |

#### PHLMC Hetauda

| Financial Year    | Voucher no. | Value date | Transaction description                                    | Amount  | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                       |
|-------------------|-------------|------------|--|---------|------------|--|
| 2076-77 (2019-20) | 4           | 2076.11.11 | Freight charges for delivering the vaccines (M/R Vaccines) | 206,454 | 11,310     | Vat amount claimed from Gavi Fund.                     |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 37          | 2074.07.26 | Delivery of medicines (M/R)                                | 9,860   | 500        | Newspaper ad for festival. Not related to immunisation |
|                   |             |            | Total  | 216,314 | 11,810     |  |

#### **Kavre Health Office**

| Financial Year    | Voucher no. | Value date | Transaction description   | Amount    | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                                       |
|-------------------|-------------|------------|---|-----------|-------------|------------|--|
|                   |             |            | Program expenditure   | 19,400    |             | 19,400     | Expenses of unrelated program  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 63          | 2079.02.16 | Supervision of covid vaccination program  |           |             |            | charged to GAVI Fund.  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 65          | 2079.02.17 | Program expenditure Supervision and management program of Vitamin A dose  | 6,200     |             | 6,200      | Expenses of unrelated program charged to GAVI Fund.                    |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 80          | 2079.03.15 | Fuel expenditure  | 80,923    | 80,923      |            | No supporting available  |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | 53          | 2079.11.24 | Vaccine transportation expenses   | 2,028,612 |             | 2,028,612  | The transportation expense could not be traced to TCV campaign expense |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 159         | 2075.03.26 | Purchase of auto parts and service charges  | 37,374    | -           | 4,300      | VAT claimed as expenditures  |
| 2074-75 (2017-18) | 8           | 2074.11.15 | Purchase of Machinery and other items (stabilisers, generator etc. , voucher amount is NRs. 318321, only 59,325 is charged to GAVI) | 59,325    |             | 3,662      | VAT claimed as expenditures  |
|                   |             |            | Total   | 2,231,834 | 80,923      | 2,062,174  |  |

#### **PHD Hetauda**

| Financial Year    | Voucher no.        | Value date | Transaction description       | Amount in supporting document | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning |
|-------------------|--------------------|------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|
|                   | Unidentified (not  |            | Food expenses                 |                               |            | VAT claimed as expenses          |
| 2078-79 (2021-22) | mentioned in file) | 2078.12.24 |                               | 28,000                        | 3,220      |                                  |
|                   | 28                 |            | Fuel expenses                 |                               |            | VAT claimed as expenses          |
|                   | (Budget sub-head   |            |                               | 45,147                        | 4,587      |                                  |
| 2073-74 (2016-17) | 370804)            | 2073.09.17 |                               |                               |            |                                  |
|                   | 28                 |            | Stationery and other expenses |                               |            | VAT claimed as expenses          |
|                   | (Budget sub-head   |            |                               | 51,907                        | 4,208      |                                  |
| 2073-74 (2016-17) | 370804)            | 2073.09.17 |                               |                               |            |                                  |
|                   | 28                 |            | Purchase of Bag               |                               |            | VAT claimed as expenses          |
|                   | (Budget sub-head   |            |                               | 185,000                       | 20,709     |                                  |
| 2073-74 (2016-17) | 370804)            | 2073.09.17 |                               |                               |            |                                  |
|                   |                    |            |                               |                               | 32,724     |                                  |
|                   |                    |            | Total                         | 310,054                       |            |                                  |

#### PHD Doti

| Voucher n° | Value date       | Transaction description                    | Amount  | Irregular | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning |
|------------|------------------|--|---------|-----------|------------|----------------------------------|
| 104        | 03 Asadh 2075    | Vaccination program survey                 | 240,000 | 30,000    |            | No vehicle log book              |
| 28         | 14 Baishakh 2079 | Program expenses - Typhoid Vaccine program | 646,575 |           | 10,385     | Rs.10,385 paid for VAT           |
|            |                  | Total                                      | 886,575 | 30,000    | 10,385     |                                  |

#### PHLMC Kailali

| Voucher n° | Value date        | Transaction description  | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning  |
|------------|-------------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|---|
| 5          | 2 Poush 2078      | Payment made to various person for program expense (<br>Total 7 Person )                       | 162,220   | 65,400     | 96,820      |            | For Inadequate – name of traveller not available, details of payment not available, attendance not available, e-ticket not available Rs. 96,820 unsupported expenses. |
| 51         | 31 Jestha 2079    | Payment of bill such as program expense to Junga bahadur baduwal, David bikram bista & others  | 38,714    |            |             | 22,900     | Rs. 22,900 is not related with the Gavi project( Expenses is for Beruju Samndhama)  |
| 2          | 22 Magh 2074      | Technical good service ,other equipment  | 497,990   |            |             | 41,990     | Rs. 41,990 paid for VAT   |
| 1          | 19 Magh 2074      | Payment to technical goods suppliers, servo stablisers   | 115,000   |            |             | 13,000     | Rs. 13000 paid for VAT     Quotation not obtained   |
| 39         | 31 Ashadh<br>2075 | Payment against bill like construction company,bist construction etc                           | 238,279   | 209,518    |             | 28,761     | Rs.28761.05 was paid for VAT     No quotations has been obtained from suppliers.  |
| 11         | 29 Magh 2074      | Payment made based upon the bill and submitted and deposited in NIC asia bank branch dhangadhi | 94,555    |            |             | 1,617      | VAT charged as expense  |
| 16         | 26 Ashadh<br>2074 | Payment of travel related expenses   | 5,200     |            | 3,000       |            | Unsupported expenses for Rs.3000  |
|            |                   | Total  | 1,151,958 | 274,918    | 99,820      | 108,268    |   |

#### **HO** Kailali

| Voucher n° | Value date      | Transaction description                                      | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                            |
|------------|-----------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|---|
| 107        | 3 Ashadh 2077   | Payment for Dadura- Rubella Vaccination Program              |           |            |             |            | 1. Attendance sheet is not attached with the payment list.  |
| 107        | 3 Asnadh 2077   | Payment for Dadura- Rubena Vaccination Program               | 90,400    | 42,000     |             |            | 2. No other alternative evidence to support the expenditure |
| 111        | 3 Ashadh 2077   | Payment for Dadura- Rubella Vaccination Program              |           |            |             |            | 1. Attendance sheet is not attached with the payment list.  |
| 111        | 3 Asnadh 2077   |  | 66,900    | 18,100     |             |            | 2. No other alternative evidence to support the expenditure |
| 103        | 3 Ashadh 2077   | Payment for Dadura- Rubella Vaccination Program-             |           |            |             |            | Attendance sheet is not attached with the payment list.     |
| 103        | 3 ASTIAUTI 2077 | Settlement of Advance given to dipendra Budha                | 94,505    | 67,000     |             |            | 2. No other alternative evidence to support the expenditure |
| 46         | 11 Falgun 2076  | Payment for Dadura- Rubella Vaccination Program              | 12,400    |            | 12,400      |            | No supporting document available                            |
| 102        | 3 Ashadh 2077   | Payment for Dadura- Rubella Vaccination Program-             |           |            |             |            | 1. Attendance sheet is not attached with the payment list.  |
| 102        | 5 ASTIGUIT 2077 | Settlement of Advance given to Tek Bahadur Hamal.            | 71,205    | 52,500     |             |            | 2. No other alternative evidence to support the expenditure |
| 321        | 31 Ashadh 2079  | Payement for program related to Typhoid Vaccination          |           |            |             |            | VAT charged as expense                                      |
| 321        | 31 ASHAUH 2079  | Distribution   | 251,200   |            |             | 3,144      |   |
| 174        | 10 Jacobs 2070  | Payment for District level typhoid Vaccination distribution- |           |            |             |            | VAT charged as expense                                      |
| 174        | 18 Jestha 2079  | Settlement of Pradip joshi's advance                         | 2,100,000 |            |             | 4,067      |   |
|            |                 | Total  | 2,674,210 | 179,600    | 12,400      | 7,211      |   |

#### **HO Kanchanpur**

| Voucher n° | F.Y.                | Value date           | Transaction description                                     | Amount  | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|------------|---------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|------------|--|
| 142        | 2017-18/20<br>74-75 | 20th Chaitra<br>2074 | Training Cost   | 57,000  |            | 57,000     | Expenditure is not related to training (Electronic Items purchased)                      |
| 3          | 2017-18/20<br>74-75 | 22nd Falgun<br>2074  | Amount paid to Kedar Electronics and Suppliers for supplies | 114,994 | 101,765    | 13,229     | Rs.13,229.45 paid for VAT     No quotations has been obtained for purchase of equipment. |
|            |                     |                      | Total   | 171,994 | 101,765    | 70,229     |  |

### **HO** Palpa

| Voucher n° | Value date      | Transaction description                              | Amount  | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|------------|-----------------|--|---------|------------|------------|--|
| 2076-77    |                 | Rota Virus Immunisation Campaign                     |         |            |            |  |
| 49         | '3/31/2077      | District level Orientation on Rota Virus Vaccination | 379,800 |            | 5,107      | Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible  |
| 2076-77    |                 |  |         |            |            |  |
| 45         | 2077-03-27      | Vaccination Transport expenses                       | 173,100 | 173,100    |            | No Supportings other than Payment list is available  |
|            | 2076-77         | Volunteer Expenditure                                | 505,600 | 505,600    |            | Attendance Sheet is not atttached with the payment sheet  No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
| 76-77      | 2076-77         | Chief Supervision Travelling Allowance expd          | 138,600 | 138,600    |            | Supervision Report is not available  |
|            | 2076-77         | Vaccinator Travelling Allowance expd                 | 472,500 | 472,500    |            | Attendance Sheet is not atttached with the payment sheet  No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
| FY 2078-79 |                 | Typhoid Immunisation Programme                       |         |            |            | ·  |
| File 1     | 17-& 18/12/2078 | Tansen, Hotel Pauwa                                  | 157,400 |            | 2,945      | Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible  |
| File 1     | 15-16/12/2078   | Rampur, Hotel Shrinagar Upper hall                   | 143,906 |            | 2,227      | Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible  |
| File 1     | 15-16/12/2078   | Rampur, Hotel Shrinagar lower hall                   | 131,854 |            | 3,984      | Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible  |
| File 1     | 13 & 14/12/2078 | Tansen, Hotel Pauwa                                  | 150,000 |            | 2,991      | Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible  |
| FILE NO 2  | 20/12/78        | Hotel Annapurna<br>Tansen                            | 124,440 |            | 1,648      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
| FILE NO 2  | 19/12/78        | Hotel Shri Nagar<br>Rampur                           | 96,017  |            | 1,811      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
| FILE NO 2  | 19/12/78        | Hotel Shri Nagar<br>Rampur                           | 120,295 |            | 1,575      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
| FILE NO 2  | 17/12/78        | Hotel Annapurna<br>Tansen                            | 124,200 |            | 1,725      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
| FILE NO 2  | 14/12/78        | Hotel Annapurna<br>Tansen                            | 116,970 |            | 1,518      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure   |

| Voucher n° | Value date | Transaction description         | Amount    | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                 |
|------------|------------|---------------------------------|-----------|------------|------------|--|
|            |            | TYPHOID EXPENDITURE - RS 354150 |           |            |            |  |
|            |            | AT HOTEL ANNAPURNA _ TANSEN     |           |            |            |  |
|            | 24/02/79   | Hall Rent, Refreshment          | 13,400    |            | 1,542      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure |
|            | 28/02/79   | Hall Rent, Refreshment          | 34,080    |            | 3,921      | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure |
|            | 14/03/79   | Media Expenditure               | 3,000     |            | 345        | VAT payment is treated as ineligible expenditure |
| TOTAL      |            |                                 | 2,885,162 | 1,289,800  | 31,339     |  |

#### PHD Lumbini

| Voucher n° | Value date | Transaction description            | Amount    | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|------------|------------|------------------------------------|-----------|------------|------------|--|
| 2076-77    |            |                                    |           |            |            |  |
|            | 2076-10-06 | Rota Immunisation propgramme       | 426,684   | 28,350     | 16,570     | Payment Approver signature was not present either in payment sheet or claim form for payment of Rs 28350     Vat has been charged as expense thus classified as ineligible |
|            |            | MR/ ROTA IMMUNISATION PROGRAM EXPD |           |            |            |  |
|            | 2076       | Refresment/ Food bill              | 152,000   |            | 16,567     | VAT is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
|            | 2076       | COMPUTER EXPS.                     | 27,300.00 |            | 1,127      | VAT is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
|            | 2076       | Meeting exps. / HALL Rent          | 42,120.00 |            | 3,120      | VAT is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
| 2078-79    | 2079-03-12 | Typhoid Immunisation Programme     |           |            |            |  |
|            |            | Hotel, Meal, conference            | 123,735   |            | 14,235     | VAT is treated as ineligible expenditure   |
|            |            | Food, Conference                   | 12,131    |            | 1,396      |  |
| TOTAL      |            |                                    | 783,970   | 28,350     | 53,015     |  |

#### **PHLMC Butwal**

| Voucher n° | Value date | Transaction description                                 | Amount  | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning  |
|------------|------------|---|---------|------------|------------|---|
| 2074-75    |            |   |         |            |            |   |
| 37         | 02/01/75   | Travelling and daily allowance for programme monitoring | 18,300  | 18,300     | 0          | Approval of the supervisor was not available for the expenditure  |
| 47         | 03/05/75   | Programe Expenditure                                    | 131,233 | 131,233    | 0          | General Voucher, Medical Bill and payment order and paymnet receipt is attached amounting Rs.931233/ Out of which Rs.800, 000/- is funded by government and balance amount by GAVI.  Quotation or purchase order is not available |
| 53         | 22/03/75   | Programe meeting expenditue                             | 39,150  | 28,000     | 0          | Minutes of the meetings not available   |
| TOTAL      |            |   | 188,683 | 177,533    | 0          |   |

### HO Rupandehi

| Voucher n° | Value date | Transaction description          | Amount  | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                                 |
|------------|------------|----------------------------------|---------|------------|-------------|------------|--|
| FY 2076-77 |            | Dadura Rubela Khop abhiyan( MR   |         |            |             |            |  |
|            |            | campaign)                        |         |            |             |            |  |
| File no 7  |            | Group 3                          | 282,659 |            |             | 4,013      | Vat has been charged as expense                                  |
| 2078-79    |            | Typhoid Immunistion Programme    |         |            |             |            |  |
| 2078-79    |            | Omsatiya Rural Municipalities    | 251,703 | 37,600     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Marcharwari Rural Municipalities | 235,482 | 28,000     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Suddhodhan Rural Municipalities  | 254,422 | 30,000     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Kotahimai Rural Municipalities   | 337,725 | 43,200     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Butwal Sub Metropolitian         | 784,777 | 118,200    |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Kanchan Rural Municipality       | 181,835 | 28,000     | 4,600       |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | Amount of NPR 4600 not supported                                 |
|            |            | Siddharthanagar Municipality     | 396,825 | 80,000     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Sainamain Municipality           | 403,387 | 94,400     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Gaidahawa Rural Expenditure      | 297,015 | 37,200     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Rohini Rural Municipalities      | 322,970 | 56,800     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Siyari Rural Municipalities      | 255,835 | 41,600     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Tilottma Municipalities          | 610,429 | 74,400     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Devdaha Municipalities           | 315,885 | 34,400     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Lumbini cultural Municipalities  | 424,800 | 58,000     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Sammarimai Rural Municipalities  | 269,875 | 45,200     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            |            | Mayadevi Rural Municipalities    | 307,502 | 44,800     |             |            | Attendance sheet not attached thus classified as inadequate      |
|            |            |                                  |         |            |             |            | No alternative supporting document available for the expenditure |
|            | 1-5-2079   | Vehicle Repair                   | 2,261   |            |             | 260        | Vat has been charged as expense                                  |
|            | 03-20-2079 | Stationery Purchase              | 220,008 |            |             | 25,311     | Vat has been charged as expense                                  |
|            | 12-18-2078 | Surgical Equipment Purchase      | 13,600  |            |             | 748        | Vat has been charged as expense                                  |
|            | 01-10-2079 | Food                             | 28,540  | 28,540     |             |            | No supporting found other than invoice                           |
| 83         | '3/16/2079 | Typhoid Immunistion Programme    | 91,639  |            |             | 1,255      | VAT part has been charged as expense                             |

| Voucher n° | Value date        | Transaction description                                      | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning   |
|------------|-------------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|--|
|            |                   | Full Immunisation Sustainable (Purnakhop Digopana)           |           |            |             |            |  |
|            |                   | Programme-1569910  |           |            |             |            |  |
|            | 3-26-2079         | Stationery (Certificates)                                    | 111,870   |            |             | 12,870     | Vat has been charged as expense  |
|            |                   | Typhoid Immunisation Traning Programme Expd detail - 1150859 |           |            |             |            |  |
| GROUP 1    | 17/12/78          | Hotel Vahudmaya, Lumbini                                     | 396,398   | 396,398    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| GROUP 2    | 18/12/78          | Hotel Peace night, Bhairawa                                  | 385,861   | 385,861    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| GROUP 3    | 19/12/78          | Aarambh Resort, Butwal                                       | 368,600   | 290,000    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
|            | 20/12/78          | Typhoid Immunisation Media<br>Expenditure -50300             |           |            |             |            |  |
|            |                   | Travelling Allowance   | 34,000    | 34,000     |             |            | Payment sheets are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor                       |
|            |                   | Typhoid Immunisation Programe meeting expense 1313646        |           |            |             |            |  |
| GROUP 1A   | 15-<br>16/12/2078 | Refreshment  | 112,278   |            |             | 12,917     | VAT amount is treated as Ineligible expenditure  |
| GROUP 1A   | 15-<br>16/12/2078 | Travelling Allowance   | 289,220   | 289,220    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| GROUP 1B   |                   | Travelling Allowance   | 266,800   | 266,800    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| GROUP 2A   | 15-<br>16/12/2078 | Stationery   | 72,247    |            |             | 8,311      | VAT amount is treated as Ineligible expenditure  |
| GROUP 2A   | 15-<br>16/12/2078 | Travelling Allowance   | 312,000   | 312,000    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| GROUP 2B   | 15-<br>16/12/2078 | Travelling Allowance   | 217,600   | 217,600    |             |            | Payment sheet and Travel claim bills are not duly approved by concerned authority / supervisor |
| TOTAL      |                   |  | 8,856,048 | 3,072,219  | 4,600       | 65,685     |  |

### PHD Dhanusha

| Voucher n°        | Value date   | Transaction description | Amount | Inadequate | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning  |
|-------------------|--------------|-------------------------|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------------------|
| 2019-20 (2076/77) |              |                         |        |            |            |                                   |
| 13                | 25 Magh 2076 | Hall Charges            | 46,770 |            | 16,770     | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure |
| 31                | 6 Jesth 2077 | Monitoring allowance    | 39,100 | 30,400     |            | Attendance sheet not available    |
|                   |              |                         | 85,870 | 30,400     | 16,770     |                                   |

#### **HO Dhanusha**

| Voucher n°   | Value date      | Transaction description                             | Amount  | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning  |
|--------------|-----------------|---|---------|------------|-------------|------------|---|
| 2017/18 (207 | 74/75)          |   |         |            |             |            |   |
| , ,          |                 | Allowances to Doctor for Supervision in D.R.T.B     |         |            |             |            |   |
| 34           | 22 Asadh 2075   | hostel  | 92,000  |            |             | 92,000     | 1 0   |
|              |                 |   | 584,250 | 107,390    | 476,860     |            | Attendance sheet not available. No Supportings available for NPR  |
| 123          | 31 Asadh 2075   | Daily Allowances                                    |         |            |             |            | 584250  |
|              | 31 Asadh 2075   | Food Expenses                                       | 94,400  |            | 94,400      |            | No Supportings available  |
|              | 31 Asadh 2075   | Stationery , training material and banner           | 96,008  |            | 96,008      |            | No Supportings available  |
|              | 31 Asadh 2075   | Travel expenses                                     | 18,550  |            | 18,550      |            | No Supportings available  |
| 39           | 31 Asadh 2075   | Expenditure related to allowances                   | 193,359 |            | 193,359     |            | No Supportings available  |
|              |                 | Food expenditure for the patients staying in hostel |         |            |             |            |   |
| 33           | 22 Asadh 2075   | for D.R.T.B   | 101,400 |            |             | 101,400    | The expenditure related to T.B programme  |
| 22           | 22 4 11- 2075   | Expenditure related to purchase of medicines for    | 22 542  |            |             | 22.542     | The control of the control of the T. D. Control of the Control of |
| 32           | 22 Asadh 2075   | the patients statying in D.R.T.B Hostel             | 23,512  |            |             | 23,512     | The expenditure related to T.B programme  |
| 2019/20 (207 | 76 <u>/</u> 77) |   |         |            |             |            |   |
|              |                 |   |         | 98,500     |             |            | 1.No Report for the training  |
|              | 7               | Allowances for training for Measles and Rubella     | 98,500  |            |             |            | 2.Participants attendance sheet not available   |
| 22           | 7 Jestha 2077   | Vaccine   |         | 45.000     |             |            | 3.No Claim Bill of the daily allowances and travel allowances   |
|              |                 |   | 45.000  | 45,000     |             |            | 1.No Report for the training  |
| 41           | 21 Ashar 2077   | MR Campaign Allowances for training                 | 45,000  |            |             |            | 2.Participants attendance sheet not available     3.No Bill of the daily allowances and travel allowances   |
| 43           | 21 Ashar 2077   | Rota Campaign expenses                              | 65,580  |            | 5,120       |            | No supporting document for amount 5120  |
| 43           | ZI ASIIdi ZOTT  | Nota Campaign expenses                              | 5,480   | 5,480      | 3,120       |            | 1.Participant list not available  |
|              | 21 Ashar 2077   | Stationery  | 3,480   | 3,400      |             |            | 2. No Report for the training conducted   |
|              | 227101101 2077  | Stationery  |         | 36,100     |             |            | 1.Participant list not available  |
|              | 21 Ashar 2077   | Food Expenses                                       | 36,100  |            |             |            | 2. No Report for the training conducted   |
|              |                 |   | •       | 24,000     |             |            | 1.Participant list not available  |
|              | 21 Ashar 2077   | Hall expenses                                       | 24,000  | •          |             |            | 2. No Report for the training conducted   |
|              |                 |   | 256,912 | 106,350    | 150,562     |            | Attendance sheet not available. Supporting document not   |
| 26           | 27 Jestha 2077  | MR Campaign   |         |            |             |            | available for NPR 150562  |
| 69           | 31 Ashad 2077   | Daily allowances                                    | 511,360 |            | 49,842      |            | No supporting available   |
| 69           | 31 Ashad 2077   | Supervision Allowances for TVC                      | 300,500 |            | 6,500       |            | No supporting available   |
| 30           | 5 Jestha 2077   |   | 990,860 | 990,860    |             |            | 1.No Details of the amount paid to the workers for training is  |
|              |                 | TCV Campaign Exp                                    |         |            |             |            | available.  |
|              |                 |   |         |            |             |            | 2.No Attendance sheet available   |
| 2020/21 (207 | 77/78)          |   |         |            |             |            |   |
|              |                 |   |         |            |             |            | No Visit report found. No payment receipt form available  |
| 114          | 20 Jestha 2078  | Supervision of Rastriya Khop                        | 71,000  | 61,400     | 9,600       |            | No supporting document available for NPR 9600   |
| 2020/21 (207 |                 |   |         |            |             |            |   |
| 244          | 32 Asadh 2079   | Travel allowances                                   | 62,455  | 9,000      | 53,455      |            | Attendance sheet not available for inadequate expenses, for balance amount no supporting documents found.   |
| 222          | 32 Asadh 2079   | TCV program expenses -Allowances to health          | 127,500 | 127,500    |             |            | balance amount no supporting documents found.   |
|              | 32 A3au11 2073  | workers   | 127,300 | 127,300    |             |            | 1.No Attendance sheet available   |
|              |                 |   |         | _          | _           |            | 2. No other supportings, travel order, claim bill etc is available  |

| Voucher n° | Value date      | Transaction description                            | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                                   |
|------------|-----------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|--|
| 213        | 32 Asadh 2079   | TCV program expenses -Allowances                   | 204,500   | 204,500    |             |            |  |
|            |                 |  |           |            |             |            | 1.No Attendance sheet available                                    |
|            |                 |  |           |            |             |            | 2. No other supportings, travel order, claim bill etc is available |
| 162        | 32 Asadh 2079   | Hall Charges                                       | 8,850     |            |             | 1,150      | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
| 149        | 32 Asadh 2079   | Stationery   |           |            |             | 8,235      |  |
|            |                 |  | 99,265    |            |             |            | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
| 93         | 20 Jestha 2079  | TCV campaign related expenses                      | 678,673   |            | 678,673     |            | No supporting documents available                                  |
|            | 20 Jestha 2079  | Stationery(Purchase of managzine)                  |           |            |             | 11,401     |  |
|            |                 |  | 118,801   |            |             |            | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
|            | 20 Jestha 2079  | Hall Charges                                       |           |            |             | 11,894     | <u> </u>   |
|            |                 |  | 124,515   |            |             |            | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
| 141        | 25th Ashar 2079 | Book Prininting expenses                           | 99,925    |            |             | 11,495     | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
|            | 25th Ashar 2079 | Projector rent fees                                | 11,000    |            | 11,000      |            | No invoice available   |
| 227        | 32 Asadh 2079   | Survey expenses for typhoid                        | 62,270    | 62,270     |             |            | Attendance sheet not available                                     |
| 207        | 32 Asadh 2079   | Allowances paid for survey to houses about list of | 120,800   |            | 7,000       |            |  |
|            |                 | children under typhoid campaign                    | •         |            | •           |            | Supporting document not available                                  |
| 108        | 7 Asadh 2079    | Media payment                                      |           |            |             | 24,674     | 11 0   |
|            |                 |  | 241,034   |            |             | ,          | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
|            | 23rd Chaitra    | Stationery   | 58,500    |            |             | 6,730      |  |
| 77         | 2078            |  |           |            |             |            | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
|            | 23rd Chaitra    | hotel  | 224,193   |            |             | 18,889     |  |
|            | 2078            |  |           |            |             |            | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure                                  |
|            |                 | Total  | 4,791,030 | 1,655,610  | 1,850,929   | 311,380    |  |
|            |                 |  |           |            |             |            |  |

### **HO Mahottari**

| S.N               | Voucher n°   | Value date | Transaction description                    | Amount    | Inadequate | Unsupported | Ineligible | Auditor's explanations/reasoning                |
|-------------------|--------------|------------|--|-----------|------------|-------------|------------|---|
| 2021-22 (2078/79) |              |            |  |           |            |             |            |   |
|                   |              |            |  | 756,000   | 756,000    |             |            | No attendance sheet available. No other         |
|                   |              | 2078/79    | Vaccinators transporation allowances for   |           |            |             |            | alternative evidence available for the          |
| 1                 | Unidentified |            | typhoid                                    |           |            |             |            | expenditure                                     |
|                   |              | 2078/79    | FCHVs transporation costs for typhoid      | 736,800   | 736,800    |             |            | No attendance sheet available. Travel order and |
| 2                 | Unidentified | 20/6//9    | campaign                                   |           |            |             |            | claim not available                             |
| 2019-20 (2076/77) |              |            |  |           |            |             |            |   |
| 3                 | Unidentified | 10/6/2073  | Hall Charges                               | 29,953    |            |             | 2,656      | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure               |
| 4                 | Unidentified | 2076/77    | Hall Charges                               | 35,943    |            |             | 4,134      | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure               |
| 5                 | Unidentified | 3/16/2077  | Orientation on Rota and Hyigeine promotion | 95,910    |            | 95,910      |            | No supporting documents available.              |
|                   |              |            | Hall charges                               | 44,024    |            |             | 5,064      | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure               |
| 2017/18 (2074/75) |              |            |  |           |            |             |            |   |
| 6                 | 5            | 3/25/2075  | Purchase of Stabliser                      | 114,000   |            |             | 13,230     | Vat Amount Charged as expenditure               |
|                   |              |            | Total                                      | 1,812,630 | 1,492,800  | 95,910      | 25,084     |   |

### **PHLMC Dhanusha**

| Voucher n°        | Value date   | Transaction description        | Amount | Irregular | Auditor's explanations/reasoning |
|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|--------|-----------|----------------------------------|
| 2021/22 (2078/79) |              |                                |        |           |                                  |
| 1                 | 18 Magh 2078 | Transporation cost of vaccines | 24,695 | 24,695    | No log book available            |
|                   |              | Total                          | 24,695 | 24,695    |                                  |

## Annex 6 – Detailed status of the activities of the AP as per their terms of reference

| Sl. No. | AP Scope of Work  | Audit Team Remarks  |
|---------|---|---|
| ^       | Review of Administrative, Financial and Accounting Procedures Manual and    | The review was undertaken in Oct-Dec 2023 and findings were provided. However, findings were not rated,       |
| Α       | provide recommendations   | root causes, recommendations with an implementation plan were not included to facilitate monitoring.          |
| В       | Budgeting   |   |
| 4       | Support the country in developing / improving procedures for budgeting and  | Review of budgeting process was not done to help identify weaknesses. AP focussed on budget review only       |
| 1       | forecasting. Review of budget prior to submission to Gavi for approval.     | and this is a missed opportunity to provide recommendations for improving processes and procedures.           |
| 2       | Review budget monitoring process to ensure timeliness and relevance of      | Not done  |
| 2       | variance analysis.  | Not dolle   |
| 3       | Review disbursement forecast.   | Not done  |
| 4       | Review budgets prepared by the country including provincial budgets as well | Done  |
| 5       | Tracking disbursement, utilisation and cash balance on quarterly basis      | Done  |
| С       | Payment of Goods / Services   |   |
| 1       | Ensure adequate procedures are there  |   |
| 2       | Check compliance with payment procedures                                    | Not done consistently. We noted that it was only done when financial spot check is being conducted and on     |
| 3       | Ensure transactions are in accordance with grant agreement, have relevant   | sample basis. Review requirements should be clarified.  |
|         | documentation as well as ensuring all transactions are approved.            |   |
| 4       | Perform ex post verification of payments including review of BRS            |   |
| 5       | Agree on a risk and control matrix  | Not done  |
| D       | Financial Reporting   |   |
| 1       | Financial Reporting on Quarterly Basis by the Country                       | Contradicts the GMR which requires 6 monthly reports. Quarterly reporting not done.                           |
| 2       | Review Monthly Financial Closure Process, Advance ageing                    | Not done  |
| 3       | Support in timely submission of all financial reports                       | Done  |
| 4       | Review transaction on sample basis reported in the financial report         | Not done consistently. We noted that it was only done when financial spot check is being conducted and on     |
| 5       | Conduct field visit for verification of documents                           | sample basis. Review requirements should be clarified.  |
| E       | External Audit  |   |
| 1       | Support the country in appointment of the auditor                           |   |
| 2       | Support the auditor in providing necessary information and documents        | Necessary support was provided  |
| 3       | Review the audit report   |   |
| 4       | Support the country in the implementation of recommendations                | Included in the work plan. Need to clarify scope as AP is finance only and recommendations cover wider scope. |
| F       | Skill Transfer / Train and Develop Capacity                                 |   |
|         | Within six months develop a Financial Management Capacity Building Plan     | Capacity building plan not done. A training plan was developed but does not have all the required skills      |
| 1       | detailing milestones, performance indicators, specific actions and expected | transfer requirements.  |
|         | timings   | transfer requirements.  |
| 2       | Provide progress update on the Plan   | Done  |
| 3       | Provide on the job training to the country                                  | Training started April 2024.  |
| 4       | Undertake quarterly assessment and develop a training plan                  | Quarterly assessment is not available   |

| G  | Procurement   |   |
|----|---|---|
| 1  | Perform a walkthrough of the procurement controls                                   | Not done as no procurements have been done.   |
| 2  | Review procurement manual   |   |
| 3  | Ensure adherence to procurement procedures  | There is a lack of segregation of duties in the requirements from AP. AP is expected to review the    |
| 4  | Provide quality assurance on the procurement process                                | Procurement manual and guidelines, provide support in procurement as well as undertake procurement    |
| 5  | Provide guidance on the tender development process                                  | review. Gavi PFM and AP should outline how segregation will be done.                                  |
| 6  | Conduct procurement review based on approved procurement plan                       |   |
|    | Conduct Programmatic Spot Check - Identify main risks areas in budget and           | D   |
| Н  | workplan and conduct onsite verifications during implementation of the              | Programmatic spot check was undertaken in Feb 2024 for MR campaign. Need to align role of AP with PFM |
|    | activities, based on assessed risk and in agreement with Gavi and MoHP.             | scope of activities.  |
| I  | Counter fraud review  |   |
|    | Review the adequacy of the country in preventing, detecting and responding          |   |
|    | to fraud  |   |
|    | Review arrangement or system in place to allow concerned persons to raise           |   |
| 1  | concerns about possible improprieties   | Not done  |
| 1  | Review whether the conflict-of-interest documents have been signed by the           | Not done  |
|    | concerned persons in the implementing departments                                   |   |
|    | Review the arrangement and policies in place for preventing, detecting and          |   |
|    | responding to fraud   |   |
| J  | GMR and Audit Report  |   |
| 1  | Monitoring and reporting the implementation of GMR and Audit Report recommendations | The status is being monitored and reported by the AP.   |
| K  | Review planning / pre campaign / implementation / post campaign activities          |   |
| 1  | Ensure preparatory activities are undertaken as per guidelines                      | Done  |
| 2  | Assess EPI readiness to undertake campaign as per readiness assessment tool         | Not done and may be beyond scope of AP/finance  |
| 3  | Develop checklist for financial transaction compliance                              | Not done  |
| 4  | Ensuring the provinces have received the guidelines                                 | Done  |
| 5  | Develop activity wise reporting template  | Done  |
| 6  | Facilitate OAG audit  | Pending   |
| 7  | Ensure monthly reconciliation of reports  | Not done  |
| 8  | Provide assurance on completion of reports  | Not done  |
| 9  | Review sample expenditure   |   |
| 10 | Report on outstanding advances including advisory support on management of advances | This is only being undertaken during financial management spot checks                                 |
| 11 | Ensure appropriate supporting are maintained  |   |
| 12 | Ensuring reports are submitted on timely basis                                      | Done  |
| 14 | Introduction of Mobile Money – Provide support and guidance to advance              |   |
| L  | discussions, scoping and possibility of adopting mobile money                       | Pending as mobile money has not been introduced.  |
|    | discussions, scoping and possibility of adopting mobile molley                      |   |

## Annex 7 – Status of management actions from the 2022 Gavi programme audit

| Issue  | Audit recommendation  | Management Action   | Action Owner  | Timelines            | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024   |
|--|---|---|---|----------------------|---|
|  | Recommendation 1  DoHS should establish a coordination platform and mechanism which brings together all divisions involved in immunisation activities to deliberate decide on planning, implementation and monitoring of immunisation activities. | Action 1  Going forward, FWD/DoHS will initiate the formation of a steering committee proposed to be chaired by Director General specifically for a coordination platform to deliberate planning, implementation and monitoring of related aspects of the National Immunisation Programme including for Gavi-funded activities with representation from different divisions under MoHP, partners and other stakeholders. The ToRs of this committee will be prepared that includes but is not limited to representation, meeting frequency, quorum, matters to be discussed, roles and responsibilities, documentation etc.   | Family Welfare<br>Division/DoHS   | 31 December<br>2023  | Revised<br>deadline June<br>30 2025                                     |
| Programme implementation and coordination arrangements were ineffective. | <ul> <li>Recommendation 2 MoHP should:         <ul> <li>Formalise accountability and reporting mechanisms between the provinces and DoHS.</li></ul></li></ul>   | Under the guidance of DoHS and MoHP, FWD/DoHS will initiate the formation of an Inter-Governmental Coordination Committee proposed to be chaired by Director General with the representation of various stakeholders of federal and provincial governments to deliberate programme planning, implementation, monitoring and reporting related aspects/challenges for National Immunisation Programme including for Gavi-funded programme activities.  FWD/DoHS will enhance the current reporting mechanism through the issue of separate reporting requirements in Programme Implementation Guidelines requesting provincial and district-based health offices to comply with the reporting requirements for Gavi. If required, the health coordination division's support would be requested to address any challenges in the programme implementation and reporting. | Family Welfare Division<br>& Financial<br>Administration Section<br>/DoHS | 30 September<br>2023 | Revised deadline for Action 2.1 – 30 June 2025  Action 2.2 is completed |

| Issue   | Audit recommendation   | Management Action   | Action Owner                    | Timelines            | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024   |
|---|--|---|---------------------------------|----------------------|---|
| There were sustainability concerns over the management of the immunisation programme. | <ul> <li>Recommendation 3         MoHP should:         <ul> <li>Carry out an assessment of its Human Resource needs at all levels, to establish what are its additional capacity and resource requirements, in order to effectively implement the immunisation programme.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Ensure that there are documented roles and responsibilities for the FWD and ensure that there is a documented handover process to ensure skills transfer whenever there are personnel changes (both for government staff as well as for partner provided technical assistance functions).</li> <li>Improve the capacity of the FWD to ensure increased involvement of the FWD in the immunisation programme.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Action 3</li> <li>The issue of inadequate HR for the immunisation programme has also been included in National Immunisation Strategy 2030 which is under development, this could be a basis for the advocacy for additional HR needs.</li> <li>The terms of reference of the Child Health and Immunisation Section under the Family Welfare Division are clearly documented. (Refer to the attachment Annex 1 MoHP ToR – page 13). Further, the newly introduced Internal Control System Guidelines 2079 of the Department of Health Services has also clearly mentioned the roles and responsibilities of the Director General, Division heads, Section heads and Chief of Financial Administration Section under Chapter 2 of the Guidelines.</li> <li>Handover and takeover processes are done in the government system, however, the documentation of it will be improved in future for changes in key staff.</li> </ul> | Family Welfare<br>Division/DoHS | 30 September<br>2023 | Completed. NIS is yet to be endorsed.                                 |
| Implementation of grant management recommendations was outstanding.                   | Recommendation 4  FWD should:  Provide an update of the pending GMRs with timelines for completion of each requirement.  Develop a tracker to include all recommendations from various assurance providers and have an escalation mechanism to ensure adequate follow up of the long outstanding items and these should be adequately monitored by the ICC to ensure timely and effective implementation   | The status update for pending GMR has been provided.     The terms of reference of ICC will be revised in line with the Immunisation Act and guidance of the National Immunisation Advisory Committee by 31 December 2023. Terms of reference of ICC will include one of the roles being monitoring of compliance of grant management requirements to be done on six-monthly basis.   | Family Welfare<br>Division/DoHS | 31 December<br>2023  | Action 4.1 - completed.  Action 4.2 - New deadline - 31 December 2024 |
| Gaps in monitoring and supervision of programme activities                            | <ul> <li>Recommendation 5</li> <li>FWD should strengthen the monitoring and supervision mechanisms by</li> <li>Developing annual supervision workplans, ToRs for supervisors as well as proper supervision tools;</li> <li>Documenting feedback from supervision and ensuring follow-up of action points; and</li> </ul>   | Action 5 FWD/DoHS will prepare supervision work plans and ToRs of supervision as well as proper supervision tools. A system of documentation of monitoring visits and action plans will be introduced, and this will be discussed in staff meetings as well as bi-weekly immunisation meetings on a quarterly basis.  | Family Welfare<br>Division/DoHS | 30 September<br>2023 | New deadline -<br>31 December<br>2024                                 |

| Issue   | Audit recommendation  | Management Action  | Action Owner  | Timelines           | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024   |
|---|---|--|---|---------------------|---|
|   | <ul> <li>Incorporating the monitoring and supervision<br/>activities funded through the Gavi supported<br/>TCA plan within the national monitoring plan to<br/>ensure capacity building of national supervisors<br/>and continuity of monitoring activities.</li> </ul>   |  |   |                     |   |
| Gaps in vaccine management systems and processes at the federal level | Recommendation 6  MoHP should ensure that:  • Quarterly stock counts are carried out at the central vaccine store and results documented.  Any variances noted should be investigated and approved before posting;  | Action 6  1. Stock counts to be done every month by Provincial and district vaccine stores. Central Vaccine store will conduct stock counts every 3 months. Documentation to be maintained.  | 1. District Vaccine store,<br>PHLMC, Central Vaccine<br>store within<br>Management<br>Division/DoHS | 1 June 2024         | New deadline<br>31 December<br>2024   |
|   | <ul> <li>Ensure that the eLMIS rollout plan is finalised and proper data quality assurance mechanisms are put in place.</li> <li>Review forecast assumptions and ensure that processes are put in place to strengthen the capture and recording of actual utilisation at health facility level, and transmission of this data to the centre.</li> <li>Proactively manage stock and ensure that any</li> </ul> | <ol> <li>eLMIS strengthening, training and expansion activities are planned in AWPB for FY 2023/24 (2080/81). By end of FY 2023/24 (2080/81), at least 60 districts will be using eLMIS for vaccine management</li> <li>Use of UNICEF's forecasting tool developed by the UNICEF Supply Division.</li> <li>At the last quarter of the year, vaccine forecasting is to be done using this tool and the forecast sent to UNICEF Supply Division for next year's supply.</li> </ol> | 2. iHMIS section,<br>Management<br>Division/DoHS  | 1 June 2024         | Partly<br>completed.<br>Deadline for<br>implementing<br>eLMIS in 60<br>districts is 31<br>December 2024 |
|   | <ul> <li>low stock is immediately reported to Gavi Alliance partners to avoid stock out incidences.</li> <li>Institute a process to capture data on wastage of vaccines, for the country to develop its own rates as these play a critical role in the forecast outcome and accuracy.</li> </ul>  | Indicators considered in forecasting are: - Actual wastage rate in the country; - Birth cohort; - Buffer stock needed.  4. Wastage data is captured through calculations using the vaccine received, vaccine supplied to service points  | 3. Vaccine Procurement<br>Section, Management<br>Division/DoHS                                      | 31 December<br>2023 | Completed   |
|   |   | and the coverage data.  This wastage is captured and recorded every month in the Health facility monthly recording sheet but may not have been recorded in electronic DHIS2 database.  | 4. Management<br>Division/DoHS  | 30 June 2024        | New deadline<br>31 December<br>2024   |
| Standard operation procedures were not updated after federalisation.  | Recommendation 7  MoHP should:  Revise the EVM SOPs and align them to the current federal system. The revised SOPs should also include procedures on eLMIS and should be disseminated at all levels and suitable trainings conducted thereon.   | Action 7  The new SOP based on EVM 2.0 Assessment report is currently in draft form and is being cleaned. This will be presented to PMT in July 2023 for review.  The costed CIP has now been prepared and is available for review.  | Management<br>Division/DoHS   | 31 August 2023      | Action 7.1 - New deadline 31 December 2024  Action 7.2 - completed                                      |

| Issue  | Audit recommendation  | Management Action  | Action Owner   | Timelines           | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024         |
|--|---|--|--|---------------------|-------------------------------------|
|  | Cost the EVM CIP and use these estimates to mobilise and advocate for the necessary resources to improve the vaccine and supply chain management processes.   |  |  |                     |                                     |
|  | Recommendation 8  MoHP should come up with CCE preventive maintenance plan at all levels and ensure that these plans are adhered to.  | Action 8 With support from UNICEF, a third-party maintenance team has been hired. The team will develop and share the preventive maintenance curriculum by July 2023. This curriculum will serve as an SOP moving further.             | Management<br>Division/DoHS                            | 31 October 2023     | Completed                           |
|  | Recommendation 9  FWD should ensure proper accountability for vaccines at all levels by:  Maintaining accurate and complete records at  | Action 9 FWD and MD will coordinate with provincial and local government to ensure staff and health workers are held accountable to their work and to ensure provincial and  | 1. Management<br>Division/DoHS                         | 30 June 2025        | Not yet due                         |
|  | <ul> <li>all levels and instituting proper handover mechanisms during staff transition.</li> <li>Availing all HFs, the required stock keeping tools/records and job aids to avoid data entry</li> </ul>                           | <ul> <li>local level gets adequate skills, tools and job aids to do their work with quality and efficiently. In addition:</li> <li>Management Division/DoHS will train cold chain focal points at province and local level.</li> </ul> | 2. Family Welfare<br>Division/ DoHS                    | 30 June 2025        | Not yet due                         |
|  | gaps.   | <ol> <li>Family Welfare Division/ DoHS will train immunisation focal points at province and local level.</li> <li>Management Division/DoHS will develop and</li> </ol>   | 3. Management     Division/DoHS      4. Family Welfare | 31 December<br>2024 | Not yet due                         |
| Stock management practices at subnational level were inadequate. |   | <ul> <li>distribute job aids at all levels on vaccine management and cold chain.</li> <li>4. Family Welfare Division/ DoHS will develop and distribute job aids at all levels on immunisation and new vaccines.</li> </ul>             | Division/ DoHS   | 31 December<br>2024 | Not yet due                         |
|  | Recommendation 10 FWD should train and provide job aids to all staff responsible for managing and handling vaccines to  | Action 10 There are several campaigns being rolled out in 2024 and we will use some opportunities to train vaccinators   | 1. Family Welfare<br>Division/ DoHS                    | 30 June 2025        | Not yet due                         |
|  | <ul> <li>comply with the established SOPs, particularly on:</li> <li>Recording of batch numbers, expiry dates and</li> <li>VVM status in the vaccine control books/ledgers.</li> </ul>  | <ul><li>and cold chain handlers during those activities as below:</li><li>1. Train all cold chain personnel and vaccinators on updated immunisation and supply chain</li></ul>   | 2. Family Welfare<br>Division/ DoHS                    | 31 March 2024       | Completed                           |
|  | <ul> <li>Recording the results of each physical stock<br/>counts, investigating the variances, reconciling with<br/>the stock records, and documenting the whole<br/>process along with justification for adjustments.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>development by Jun 2025.</li> <li>2. Harmonise and update training contents by Mar 2024.</li> <li>3. Develop and distribute job aids to all cold chain</li> </ul>   | 3. Management     Division/ DoHS      4. Management    | 31 December<br>2024 | Not yet due                         |
|  | process along with justification for adjustments.   | <ul> <li>bevelop and distribute job ands to all cold chain points by December 2024.</li> <li>Make functional the mechanism to document, sign and approve any variances on stocks between eLMIS and the physical count.</li> </ul>      | Division/ DoHS   | 31 December<br>2023 | New deadline<br>31 December<br>2024 |

| Issue   | Audit recommendation  | Management Action   | Action Owner   | Timelines              | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024         |
|---|---|---|--|------------------------|-------------------------------------|
|   | Recommendation 11  • MoHP should ensure that waste management policies are properly disseminated to all levels to ensure practices are consistent with national guidelines.   | Action 11  Management Division will work in the next Fiscal year 2080/81 (2023/24 AD) to develop an immunisation specific waste management guideline keeping within the national health care waste management guidance. This new immunisation waste guideline will provide clear guidance on how Nepal should move forward to mitigate the immunisation waste management issue.  1. Develop Immunisation Waste Management Guideline and/or SOP keeping within the National Health Care Waste Management Guideline by 30 June 2024  2. Disseminate and roll out immunisation waste management guidance by 30 June 2025 | Management Division/<br>DoHS                         | 30 June 2025           | Not yet due                         |
| Immunisation data is                              | Recommendation 12   | Action 12   | FWD in coordination                                  | 1. 31 December         | Completed                           |
| inaccurate and incomplete.                        | MoHP through the HMIS and Logistics sections should:  | <ol> <li>HIS strengthening activities will be incorporated in<br/>NIS (currently being drafted) – 2023.</li> </ol>  | with iHIMS and MD<br>(technical support from         | 2023                   |                                     |
|   | Routinely triangulate available data, including an assessment of administrative coverage data and vaccine availability / utilisation to check for accuracy  | <ol> <li>Data quality guidelines and training package will be<br/>developed to build capacity of health workers on<br/>data quality and use for evidence-based decision<br/>making (triangulation) – 2024/25.</li> </ol>  | partners)  | 2. 31 December<br>2025 | Not yet due                         |
|   | of data reported. Such analyses should be completed at national and subnational levels and any data inconsistencies noted should be validated and explained.  | 3. FWD will develop a certified e-training package on data quality and use, and eLearning platform. This will be implemented through online training and in-person training- 2025/26.   |  | 3. 31 December<br>2026 | Not yet due                         |
|   | <ul> <li>Ensure that all primary data collection tools are completed correctly and correlate or support each other.</li> <li>Update the population projections based on the</li> </ul>  | 4. CBS will start the projection of population using census -2021. DoHS/ iHIMS will consult with CBS for the upcoming yearly population projection – 2023 (in line with CBS timeline).  |  | 4. 31 December<br>2023 | Completed                           |
|   | 2021 census.  • Ensure adequate supervision at subnational level over data collection and management including follow up of recommendations to address data management gaps from routine supervision visits and programme audits. | 5. Nepal will conduct an assessment for IT maturity level for introducing individual-level vaccination records and will explore the DHIS2.0 tracker for recoding individual level vaccination records. However, roll-out will be planned in consultation with interested palika/s from 2024 onward.   |  | 5. 31 December<br>2024 | Not yet due                         |
| Data quality assurance processes were inadequate. | Recommendation 13 We recommend that the MoHP through the HMIS and Logistics sections:   | Action 13 HMIS and FWD (with support from WHO) is developing various guidelines and analytical documents on data quality and use in immunisation which are:   | FWD and MD (WHO is currently supporting in drafting) | 31 December<br>2023    | New deadline<br>31 December<br>2024 |
|   | Carries out a national wide data quality audit to<br>assess the quality of data reported and develop a  | i) RDQA process and outcome - lesson learnt from five districts – draft version 2023 Q4   |  |                        |                                     |

| Issue  | Audit recommendation  | Management Action  | Action Owner                                  | Timelines   | Status as on<br>May 9, 2024                                  |
|--|---|--|---|---|--|
|  | costed data quality improvement plan which can be used to raise resources towards data quality improvement.  • Consistently complete and document data verification and validation exercises at the health facility and district levels as required by the guidelines.  • Ensure adequate supervision at subnational level over data collection and management including follow up of recommendations to address data management gaps from routine supervision visits and programme audits. | ii) data quality assessment guideline in immunisation - 2023 Q4; and iii) training material: DHIS, eLMIS Q4 and data triangulation for immunisation.  Refer to previous recommendation for timeline as the e-learning tool is envisioned here. |   |   |  |
| There were gaps in Covid-19 vaccines and data management.  | Recommendation 14  MoHP should triangulate Covid-19 vaccination data with logistics data to ensure full accountability of vaccines as well as accurate and reliable coverage data   | Action 14 FWD will present the Covid-19 vaccination and logistics situation once a month during the FWD bi-weekly meetings.  | FWD/MD (with technical support from partners) | Immediate effect<br>- monthly basis                 | Completed  |
| There are gaps in procurement and fixed assets management. | Recommendation 15  MoHP should ensure that:  • The eLMIS assets register is updated to include all CCE. This register should be reconciled to the UNICEF CCE distribution list; CCE  • Assets registers in the PAMs and eLMIS systems are reconciled to the manual registers;  • A comprehensive assets register is maintained and used for fixed assets verification;  | Action 15  Management Division will:  1.Establish and institutionalise a mechanism of entering the assets procured by Gavi.  2. Develop and disseminate SOP to inventorise Gavifund procured assets.   | Management<br>Division/DoHS                   | 1.31 December 2023  2. 31 July 2024  3. 31 December | New deadline 31 December 2024  New deadline 31 December 2024 |
|  | <ul> <li>Assets are properly tagged for their easy identification and verification.</li> <li>Procurement plan for Gavi funded procurements be prepared either separate or included in the DoHS procurement plan.</li> <li>Preventative maintenance plans are completed and implemented at all CCE points.</li> </ul>  | <ul><li>3. Develop and institutionalise a mechanism to use stickers on assets procured by Gavi funds.</li><li>4. Develop and disseminate preventive maintenance SOP.</li></ul>   |   | 3. 31 December 2023 4. 31 December 2023             | Completed Completed  |

# Annex 8 – Management action plan from the 2024 Programme Audit - Supplemental

| Issue  | Audit recommendation  | Management Action  | Action Owner               | Timelines   |
|--|---|--|----------------------------|---|
|  | Recommendation 1  | Action 1   | Action 1                   | Action 1  |
| Inadequate systematic budget and work plan monitoring and reporting system | <ul> <li>DoHS should ensure that:</li> <li>Provinces are appropriately involved in the planning process and that this process is documented;</li> <li>A process of budget monitoring is instituted, and that budget monitoring is done for all grants; and</li> <li>Expenditure is reviewed against the approved workplans and any variances investigated.</li> </ul> | DoHS has already initiated extensive involvement of provincial staffs in the planning process for Gavi funded grants and its documentation during the development of full portfolio planning application, where staffs from PHDs, PHLMCs and Health Offices based at district participated on various consultation workshops held during May 2023 to February 2024. The inputs from these participants from sub-national level were pivotal to develop activities and budget under FPP. This process will be continued in future too.  In addition to above, the staffs involved in the implementation of national immunisation programme at sub-national level are also invited in finalisation of Programme Implementation Guidelines to implement activities planned under AWPB and their inputs are obtained on an annual basis. | FWD-DoHS                   | 31 December<br>2024   |
|  |   | Action 2  Section 19 of Fiscal Procedures and Financial Accountability Act 2076 mandates budget monitoring of activities approved to the chief of the office implementing the programme. FCGO is not mandated and required to perform the budget monitoring role. DoHS has a practice of performing quarterly review meeting where the monitoring of implementation of activities is performed. Also, budget monitoring practices exist at the provincial offices and health offices at least on semester basis. Going forward, the monitoring of work plan and budget of Gavi funded activities will continued to be done at DoHS with documentation of analysis on variances.  | Action 2 FWD-DoHS FAS-DoHS | Action 2  Within one month from end of every semester of Nepalese Fiscal Year |
| Gaps in financial  | Recommendation 2  | Action 3   | Action 3                   | Action 3  |
| management resulted in questioned expenditures                             | We recommend that MoHP in consultation with provincial government:  | Acknowledging capacity gaps in terms of compliance with Gavi's financial and grant management  | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS       | Ongoing starting<br>April 2024  |

| arraining of the provincial and aff on financial management with grant management expenditures are adequately adequate and accurate ments, as well as instituting a reverifying expenditures. grants are not used to incur that a mechanism to identify paid from Gavi grants is put  | Management Action  requirements, trainings are being conducted to orient accounting and immunisation staff on Gavi's financial management, reporting and audit related requirements including provisions of PFA and GMRs in seven provinces since April 2024 last two years through Assurance Provider with support from Gavi. A detailed training plan has been developed and will be implemented by the Assurance Provider apart from providing on the job training.  |  |   |
|---|---|--|---|
| lar supervisions to the sub-<br>ake place, to review the  | DoHS has also planned certain capacity building activities including the trainings in full portfolio planning application to be submitted to the Gavi by 23 September 2023.   |  |   |
| ing review of their financial esponding activities. Relevant is (with a corresponding ces per funding source) are to disigned off by the senior im, to ensure accuracy and emplate when preparing fund to that pertinent details are ded which could be helpful for crict to account for Gavi grants is well as help during the time terised accounting systems and health offices for use in | Action 4  The programme audit covered the period of six years (Nepalese Fiscal Years 2016/17 to 2021/22) which faced the transition phase of the federalisation in the country, posing challenges in retention of financial management records and making it available for audit.  DoHS acknowledges responsibility for retention of records, however it is also equally important to highlight and understand practical circumstances in arranging the supporting documents of six financial years and twenty-two implementing offices specially when most of the staff who were involved in the implementation of programme and financial management of programme were had either retired from their job or transferred to another offices post federalisation. The storage capacity of some of the offices audited and re-structuring of offices are also key factors leading to unsupported expenditure.  DoHS has already implemented certain actions that contribute to retention of financial management records of Gavi funded programmes at least for 5 fiscal | Action 4  FWD-DoHS FAS-DoHS  | Action 4  16 July 2025  |
|   | lar supervisions to the sub- ake place, to review the stricts' financial management ing review of their financial esponding activities. Relevant is (with a corresponding ces per funding source) are to disigned off by the senior in, to ensure accuracy and emplate when preparing fund to that pertinent details are ded which could be helpful for crict to account for Gavi grants is well as help during the time terised accounting systems and health offices for use in and reporting.  | application to be submitted to the Gavi by 23 September 2023.  Action 4  The programme audit covered the period of six years (Nepalese Fiscal Years 2016/17 to 2021/22) which faced the transition phase of the federalisation in the country, posing challenges in retention of financial management records and making it available for audit.  DoHS acknowledges responsibility for retention of records, however it is also equally important to highlight and understand practical circumstances in arranging the supporting documents of six financial years and twenty-two implementing offices specially when most of the staff who were involved in the implementation of programme and financial management of programme were had either retired from their job or transferred to another offices post federalisation. The storage capacity of some of the offices audited and re-structuring of offices are also key factors leading to unsupported expenditure.  DoHS has already implemented certain actions that contribute to retention of financial management | application to be submitted to the Gavi by 23 September 2023.  Action 4  The programme audit covered the period of six years (Nepalese Fiscal Years 2016/17 to 2021/22) which faced the transition phase of the federallisation in the country, posing challenges in retention of financial management records and making it available for audit.  DoHS acknowledges responsibility for retention of records, however it is also equally important to highlight and understand practical circumstances in arranging the supporting documents of six financial years and twenty-two implementing offices specially when most of the staff who were involved in the implementation of programme and financial management of programme were had either retired from their job or transferred to another offices post federalisation. The storage capacity of some of the offices audited and re-structuring of offices are also key factors leading to unsupported expenditure.  DoHS has already implemented certain actions that contribute to retention of financial management records of Gavi funded programmes at least for 5 fiscal years after the end of the grant activity. This specific requirement is included in the programme |

| Issue | Audit recommendation | Management Action  | Action Owner         | Timelines                     |
|-------|----------------------|--|----------------------|-------------------------------|
|       |                      | management and reporting related circular is issued every year. Also, implementing offices are mandatorily required to fill up the voucher number and date for Gavi approved activity in the financial report, this will facilitate easy tracking of the documents in future audits. This practice will be regularised in upcoming periods and monitored on an annual basis.  Capacity building and training activities are also being undertaken through the support of the Assurance |                      |                               |
|       |                      | Provider and is expected to strengthen the financial management practices in the future.  Action 5   |                      |                               |
|       |                      | ACTION 5   | Action 5             | Action 5                      |
|       |                      | In the fiscal year, after the Gavi programme audit in June 2022, DoHS allocated budgets to the provinces to charge the VAT paid from Gavi grants to a dedicated activity under GoN source and implementing office are charging VAT to this activity. This has been communicated to the respective offices through the Programme Implementation Guidelines. Going forward no VAT ill be charged to Gavi grants.   | FAS-DoHS             | Ongoing starting<br>July 2024 |
|       |                      | Action 6   |                      |                               |
|       |                      |  | Action 6             | Action 6                      |
|       |                      | Payments for any activities planned under AWPB are done through treasury single account (TSA) system, which is a zero-balance account under FCGO and PTCOs structures. Based on signed payment order form from the implementing offices, DTCOs/PTCOs make payment to the recipient. Since, the offices do not have to maintain a separate bank account, there is no requirement for them to prepare and sign off bank reconciliation statements.                                       | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS | 16 July 2025                  |
|       |                      | To address this finding, DoHS will ensure that regular supervisions also include review of the financial management practices of the implementing offices, including review of their financial reports and corresponding activities. A specific checklist for financial  |                      |                               |

| Issue  | Audit recommendation   | Management Action  | Action Owner              | Timelines                     |
|--|--|--|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
|  |  | monitoring will be developed and intergraded to regular supervision checklist.   |                           |                               |
|  |  | Action 7   | Action 7                  | Action 7                      |
|  |  | The template for fund release letter is a standard form of FCGO and details of office wise fund released amounts are incorporated into the TSA account, which facilitates the information on availability of funds. Further, to enhance control, tracking and transparency, since FY 2023-24 FWD-DoHS issues a separate letter detailing the approved budget and fund released amount office wise for every fund release from the FCGO. This practice started after the Gavi programme audit conducted in June 2022. | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS      | Ongoing starting<br>July 2024 |
|  |  | In addition to above, FCGO has rolled out a project account module as a part of Integrated Public Financial Management Services (IPFMS) since this fiscal year 2024/25 which is expected to facilitate the fund release process online.  |                           |                               |
|  |  | Action 8   | Action 8                  | Action 8                      |
|  |  | Federal and Provincial Governments are using Computerised Government Accounting System (CGAS) which facilitates accounting and generation of expenditure reports including for Gavi source. Since NFY 2024-25, FCGO has also developed a project account module as a part of Integrated Public Financial Management Services (IPFMS) integrating budgeting and accounting system, which is expected to facilitate providing real time expenditure of implementing offices and grant reporting.                       | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS      | Ongoing starting<br>July 2024 |
|  | Recommendation 3   | Action 9   | Action 9                  | Action 9                      |
| Strengthening of Assurance<br>Provider mechanism | We recommend that the MOH and the Gavi country program delivery (CPD) team jointly re-evaluate the role of the current appointed provider, as there is a need for additional capacity building and technical assistance at both national and subnational levels. | This has been discussed with the Gavi PFM management and is under consideration for the next year  | Gavi CPD and PFM<br>teams | 30 June 2025                  |

| Issue   | Audit recommendation  | Management Action   | Action Owner         | Timelines                               |
|---|---|---|----------------------|---|
|   | Following an assessment, should also be done to determine whether the assurance provider function, in its current format, is still necessary.   |   |                      |   |
|   | Recommendation 4  | Action 10   | Action 10            | Action 10                               |
| Some progress was made in addressing the 2022 programme audit recommendations | To enhance oversight over the implementation and follow-up of past recommendations, from audits and assessments/ reviews, the MoHP/DoHS management should:  • develop a tracking system at the DoHS operational level which captures all of the recommendations, ranked by priority (high, medium, low). Where recommendations are repeated across several reviews, these should all be included in the tracker with one action and action owner, to help consolidate the appropriate action being taken.  • at the ICC oversight level, develop a dashboard which takes into consideration audit recommendations, and ensure that these are allocated to an action owner with timelines for implementation.  • Include as an ICC meeting agenda item every six months (i.e. semi-annually) a progress report on the status of implementating all recommendations.  • Following the ICC's semi-annual endorsement, share with Gavi the progress update on the | DoHS will develop a tracker including the audit observation, recommendation, risk grading, responsible office to implement recommendations and the status of audit recommendations will be reviewed on a six monthly basis. This will be included in the standing agenda for the ICC meetings. The progress report on the status of implementation of all recommendations will be presented in the ICC meeting and status will be shared with Gavi. | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS | Every six months starting December 2024 |
|   | implementation of recommendations.  Recommendation 5  | Action 11   | Action 11            | Action 11                               |
| Grant management requirements are still outstanding                           | To enhance oversight over the implementation of the remaining four pending GMRs, the MoHP/DoHS management should:  • develop a tracking system at the DoHS operational level and ensure all GMR are captured, ranked by priority (i.e. high, medium, low).  • At the ICC oversight level, develop a dashboard   | DoHS will develop a tracker capturing all GMRs, action owners, timelines for implementation and its status will be presented in the ICC meeting. This will be included in the standing agenda for the ICC meetings. The progress report on the status of implementation of all recommendations will be presented in the ICC meeting and status will be shared with Gavi.  | FWD-DoHS<br>FAS-DoHS | Every six months starting December 2024 |

| Issue | Audit recommendation  | Management Action | Action Owner | Timelines |
|-------|---|-------------------|--------------|-----------|
|       | these are allocated to an action owner with                         |                   |              |           |
|       | timelines for implementation.                                       |                   |              |           |
|       | <ul> <li>Include as an ICC meeting agenda item every six</li> </ul> |                   |              |           |
|       | months (i.e. semi-annually) a progress report                       |                   |              |           |
|       | on the status of implementating all                                 |                   |              |           |
|       | recommendations.  |                   |              |           |
|       | <ul> <li>Following the ICC's semi-annual endorsement,</li> </ul>    |                   |              |           |
|       | share with Gavi the progress update on the                          |                   |              |           |
|       | implementation of recommendations.                                  |                   |              |           |