



Gavi, The Vaccine Alliance
Key recommendations of strategic importance
EVALUATION MANAGEMENT RESPONSE
CCEOP

Business Owner: HSIS and Market Shaping Teams
Partners: Gavi Alliance Partners
Evaluation Title: Evaluation of Gavi’s Cold Chain Equipment Optimization Platform (CCEOP)
Evaluation Year: 2018-2020 (MIDLINE REPORT 2019)

1.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	PMT INVOLVEMENT AND LEADERSHIP	<p>Gavi Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consider including a requirement for an updated inventory after each year of equipment deployment, encouraging a system that builds on current resources (i.e., LMIS, regular reports and processes). It could also build on lessons learned from this initial evaluation such as the strong documentation requirements put into place for the SBPs. <p>UNICEF Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Suppliers should ensure that SBP contractual agreements and terms of reference are shared with the MOH, including SOPs and warranty agreements. - Involve the MOH from the outset in discussions of implementation with the SBPs to better set expectations and as an opportunity to increase MOH ownership. - Coordinate with the MOH to plan for the subsequent equipment deployment in order to ensure the country is ready. - Develop a mechanism to receive country feedback on the implementation of the SBP 	Partially Agree	Reinforce that submission of an updated CCE inventory is a requirement for renewing CCEOP support UNICEF to share with country a summary of key contracting elements with countries

		<p>contract for installation as well as on the warranty and process for repairs.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ensure this feedback on SBP performance flows back to UNICEF SD to inform future awards. 		
2.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	SBP APPROACH	<p>Gavi Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Revisions must take into account the effectiveness of the SBP approach along with the complaint of it being too expensive and having the effect of reducing the pieces of equipment that can be procured. - For countries that have sufficient capacity, consider different models for service bundle requirement: tiered levels of support (full service, basic, etc.) or opportunity to choose from an a la carte menu (e.g. outsourcing distribution/transport of equipment to facilities, SDD installation versus ILR “plug-and-play” type of equipment, etc.) based on the most prominent need of the country; also consider allowing third-party bidding (one SPB for all CCE suppliers in a given country, not supplier-relationship dependent). <p>UNICEF Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Clarify training details with manufacturers and SBPs; engage MOHs in development of the SOPs for the SBPs to build ownership and to clarify expectations of installation standards. - Clarify deviation procedures and expectations to ensure no surprises in the future. - Ensure quality checks of installation are included as part of post installation inspection and feedback on quality flows back to UNICEF SD to inform future SBP awards. - Consider strengthening the current feedback system for equipment to be more robust and utilized. 	Agree	<p>De-linking is being tried in 6 countries to inform the next approach.</p> <p>The training materials have been reviewed to include other elements related to overall vaccine management. Also paired it with VMT in some countries.</p> <p>A Post Installation Inspection is also being conducted in various countries to assess the quality of the services offered</p>

3.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	COORDINATION AND COMMUNICATION	UNICEF Recommendation: - Clarify the details of the warranty with the manufacturers and SBPs; ensure country-level stakeholders understand the warranty and requirements. - The warranty coverage should be clearly explained during the product selection process to ensure country stakeholders are not over-valuing the extended maintenance periods offered for by a few suppliers on select models.	Agree	With regards to the warranty, a fact sheet and a FAQ have been developed and disseminated to countries.
4.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	SUSTAINABILITY AND SYSTEMS STRENGTHENING	Gavi Recommendations: - Consider requiring an updated CCE inventory as part of the ongoing process of CCEOP, encouraging a systematic way that leverages current resources and processes and does not require a high level of effort survey that is often done. - Consider financially supporting transition planning, updating maintenance plans, and longer-term Human resources capacity building for CCE technicians. UNICEF Recommendations: - Ensure the Decommissioning and Safe Disposal of Cold Chain Equipment document is available and accessible to country-level stakeholders; provide guidance on applying. - Ensure the HR Rapid Assessment for iSC document is available to country-level stakeholders; provide guidance on applying. - Following rollout of PII, ensure there is also a parallel process for country programs to report on use of warranty coverage and concerns with CCE performance in order to identify any patterns of equipment breakdown.	Agree	Guidance on decommissioning is available and is shared with countries on finalization of ODP, along with reminder of inventory updates & maintenance. Encourage subnational implementation (which is not currently happening).

5.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	OPTIMISED COLD CHAIN EQUIPMENT	<p>Ensure CCE is meeting all health facility needs and ensure transparency as to CCE choices. Continue to monitor equipment performance to track expected efficiencies.</p> <p>UNICEF Recommendations: Clarify stabilizer expectations/local voltage levels with the MOH during the application and product selection process to ensure clear communication of requirements to manufacturers. Explore the possibility of including trays/baskets with the equipment. Continue to provide feedback to the manufacturers on the performance of the CCE.</p>	Agree	Guidance on decommissioning is available and is shared with countries on finalization of ODP, along with reminder of inventory updates & maintenance. Encourage subnational implementation (which is not currently happening).
6.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	ALIGNMENT WITH GAVI GUIDELINES	<p>Gavi Recommendations:</p> <p>Use the Gavi guidelines for CCEOP to incorporate more system-strengthening activities such as developing a systematic approach to updating inventory or updating the maintenance plan.</p>	Agree	These elements will be included in the next iteration of the guidelines (2021) as the 2020 ones are already finalized. The system strengthening is a key element of the thinking around 'CCE for 5.0' and will definitely be integrated in the guidelines and other relevant documents in 5.0.
7.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	ACHIEVE FAIR AND SUSTAINABLE PRICES FOR BOTH DEVICES AND COMMISSIONING SERVICE BUNDLES	<p>We cannot provide countries with incentives to choose small quantities of CCE from other suppliers (beyond providing alternative supplier options that have lower prices at the COP stage, and through the 25% allocation (though this is not an incentive). Generally from a programmatic and procurement efficiency perspectives, we would not want to ask countries with small volume needs to procure multiple brands unless the country had a strong programmatic rationale for doing so. SD also</p>	Partially Agree	<p>25% allocation initiative and differentiated tender approach</p> <p>Update to ILR/SDD Roadmap (completed July 2019) included updated target outcomes and supporting actions on market balance, price reductions and innovation</p> <p>Piloting of de-linking in a few countries</p>

		notes that involving countries uniformly earlier in the tender process will add to delays, which runs counter to senior management in both organizations directive to continue reducing timelines. (Also to note we disagree with finding that price reductions had been deprioritized).		<p>Establish menu of options for SB implementation</p> <p>Update CCEOP application to have countries budget 3 neutral options; include guidance for large countries to split orders between two suppliers minimum if demand exceeds a specific volume threshold per year</p> <p>Updating of TCO tool</p>
8.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	STIMULATING SUPPLY TO MEET DEMAND FOR HIGH-PERFORMING, COST-EFFECTIVE AND QUALITY PRODUCTS	<p>Gavi Recommendation: Update longer-term CCE demand forecasts, reassess the optimal number of suppliers, and evaluate these against the supply capacity in the CCE market, with a more nuanced analysis by CCE type and size segment. These should be used to refine the market-shaping strategic objectives and stakeholder action plan.</p> <p>UNICEF SD Recommendation: Work closely with Gavi to monitor development of and changes to ODPs and ensure tender calendar stays on track as much as possible to maintain expected procurement volumes for 2019; when the schedule slips communicate the reasons for changes to suppliers; ensure that new differentiated tender approach results in healthier distribution of POs across eligible suppliers.</p>	Agree	<p>Update to ILR/SDD Roadmap (completed July 2019) incorporated much of this feedback, including an updated demand forecast (2019-2021). Updated Roadmap shared to all ILR/SDD suppliers.</p> <p>Update CCEOP longer-term demand forecast (5-year+ horizon)</p> <p>Revisit volume categories for 'CCE in 5.0' to determine optimal number of categories</p>
9.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	INFORMATION SHARING TO BETTER CONNECT SUPPLY AND DEMAND	<p>UNICEF SD Recommendation:</p> <p>- Continue to organize regular forums for information exchange between UNICEF, Gavi, and suppliers, which should be used to share updates on MS approaches, demand forecasts, innovation targets; consider regular schedule of</p>	Partially Agree	<p>Market Shaping Roadshows and Industry Consultations with suppliers</p> <p>Regular updates to suppliers (eg quarterly basis) on tender calendar</p>

		<p>monthly emails, quarterly calls, and face-to-face meetings as needed to provide updates on forecasts, tender schedules, and awards.</p> <p>Gavi Recommendation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gavi can participate in these regular touchpoints and share updates on the market-shaping strategy and outcomes from their perspectives and make time to gather input from individual suppliers. Consider opportunity for country stakeholder (MOH/EPI and SBPs) to participate and share feedback from deployment experience. - UNICEF SD Recommendation: Update CCEOP platform eligible model list and prices more regularly, based on actual prices from country tender awards to improve transparency and potential use of this data. - Gavi and UNICEF SD Recommendation: Align on prices so that they are consistent across CCEOP-related information sources (e.g. UNICEF website and Gavi CCEOP budget template). Ensure these reflect actual prices from recent contracts and include updates for SBP cost estimates based on actual costs from existing contracts. 		
--	--	---	--	--

10.	FINDING/S	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION
	CONTINUOUSLY INNOVATE HIGH PERFORMING, OPTIMAL TCO CCE PRODUCTS	<p>- Gavi, UNICEF, and WHO Recommendation: Following pilots and implementation of PMM and PII, ensure there is a clear feedback mechanism and data-sharing platform to ensure this information can be accessed and analyzed by a variety of stakeholders to inform future decision-making.</p> <p>-UNICEF SD Recommendation: Consider implementing a mechanism for feedback from</p>	Partially Agree	<p>CCEOP Technology Guide Updates - every 6 months from 2H 2019 onward</p> <p>Sharing of PMM and PII data within Alliance partners. IMPT will support this once it is operational in 2020</p>

		<p>countries on supplier and SBP performance, including the number of times SBPs respond to warranty requests by supplier and/or model to understand prevalence of CCE issues within the warranty period.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gavi and UNICEF Recommendation: Provide suppliers with clearer understanding of the product selection process; as the differentiated tender process is implemented, provide specifics on how countries indicate preference and for those for whom an allocation will be recommended, clarify the criteria that will be used. - UNICEF SD Recommendation: Provide suppliers with increased feedback on tender awards, as possible within procurement policies. Work with suppliers on options to introduce different “promotional” methods to build interest in new equipment, such as trial periods or bonus pieces of equipment of under-selected brands that are appropriate to the country context. Consider product demonstrations or other opportunities to share experiences with CCE performance across countries. - Gavi and UNICEF Recommendation: Revisit role of bi-annual (every two years) updates to TPPs in market-shaping strategy and overall objectives. Update CCE equipment guides and other sources reflecting platform-eligible CCE and product selection related tools more frequently to show where there have been advances in technology; consider publishing a regular, annual or twice yearly, addendum to the CCEOP Equipment guide to highlight innovations and new platform-eligible CCE, without requiring a full update to the document. 		
--	--	---	--	--

The full detailed version can be accessed by request to Gavi Secretariat.